# Path, Fruit and Nibbāna

Kheminda Thera

#### © Copyright Kheminda Thera

First edition, privately published by Dr. D. R. D. Weerasuria, Colombo, 1965. 2nd enlarged edition, privately published by Kheminda Thera, 1992. ISBN 955–9098–09–8.

# **Abbreviations**

A Aṅguttara Nikāya

D Dīgha Nikāya

Dhp Dhammapada

Dhp-a Dhammapada Aṭṭhakathā

M Majjhima Nikāya

A-a Manorathapurāṇi, Anguttara Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā

M-a Papañcasudani, Majjhima Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā

Pug Puggala-paññatti

S Saṃyutta Nikāya

Sn Suttanipāta

S-a Sārattha-Pakāsini, Saṃyutta Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā

SV Sumangalavilasini, Dīgha Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā

V Vinaya Piṭaka Mahāvagga

Vism Visuddhimagga

To the memory of the Venerable Soma Mahā Thera (23. 12. 1898-23.2.1960)

#### Release

On that happy day that we
The last of Māra see,
And go beyond his sway,
We shall in content stay,
From all desire free
To be or not to be,
Where unrest all does cease,
In depths of endless peace,
Where all that being implies,
Leaving nothing, fully dies.
Soma Thera

#### **Preface**

For many years the Venerable Soma Mahā Thera and I were interested in what is discussed in these pages. But, due to various reasons and his sudden death in 1960, a study of them could not be undertaken until a few months ago.

Early last year the Venerable Nāṇavira Thera of Bundala and I had many Dhamma discussions including these questions. This revived my interest once more, and I began to put whatever material was with me together with what we discussed into some readable form for my own use. As this study progressed it was possible to add new material. Yet this was painfully slow work owing to a painful illness I am afflicted with for over a year now. Fortunately this pain gives way to an extent when engaged in anything that can sustain one's interest for sometime. In the circumstances the present study was just what I needed for my physical condition, and of course for my mental well being as well, for these questions had long vexed my mind and needed an early solution.

As stated before, this was for my own use. But others thought that what is set forth here would also keenly interest, and be of some help, to a wide circle of those engaged in the study and practice of the teaching of the All-Compassionate One. And this has been made possible through the generosity of Dr. D. Roland D. Weerasuria who has published this volume for free distribution here and abroad in memory of Mr. Sam Hewavitarne, wishing him the happiness of Nibbāna.

May this act of faith in the Supremely Enlightened One, in His sublime Teaching that liberates, and in the Community of his Noble Disciples, some of whose attainments are here described, be to him a source of joy and strength in the journey from here to the goal!

Kheminda Thera, Vajirarama, Colombo, Ceylon, February 23, 1965.

## **Preface to the Second Edition**

The first edition had been out of print for quite some time. Several dāyakas therefore requested me to bring out a new edition. Due to their keen interest and generosity this new edition became possible.

Since the publication of the last edition, I have been able to collect more Sutta references on this subject. I have incorporated them in this edition. I am thankful to those who helped to bring about this edition.

The Printers, Karunaratne & Sons Ltd., deserve a special word of thanks for the care and attention shown by them.

Kheminda Thera Vajirarama, Colombo, Sri Lanka 8.6.1992

#### Path and Fruit

When the commoner (puthujjana) practises serenity (samatha) followed by insight ( $vipassan\bar{a}$ ) the path (magga) arises.<sup>1</sup>

This same teaching is found in four other Suttas in greater detail:

(1) By means of a simile the Venerable Ananda Thera illustrates to Uttiya, the wanderer, the sole way of transcending the plane of the commoner (puthujjanabhūmi) and of attaining to that of the Noble Ones (ariyabhūmi). He says, suppose there is a king who has a border-city well fortified with strong ramparts, towers, and a single entrance guarded by a wise sentinel, who prevents strangers from entering, and only allows persons known to enter, the city. As he inspects the path leading round (within the rampart) he will not note all the joints and openings in those ramparts such as will be big enough to permit a creature as small as a cat to pass through. But this he would know; "that any bigger creature would have to pass only through this single entrance." Continuing, the Venerable Ānanda Thera in answer to Uttiya's question, "Will the whole world, or a half of it, or a third of it, realise Nibbāna?" says that just as the wise sentinel is not concerned with the question of how many enter the city, but knows that anyone entering the city does so through this single entrance, so the Tathagata is concerned only with how Nibbana is realised, and not with the question of how many realise it. And the Venerable Ānanda Thera proceeds, "Whosoever have gone out, are going out, or will go out, from this world (to Nibbāna), all of them have done so (are doing so, or will do so) by giving up the five hindrances (pañca nīvaraṇe pahāya), those impurities of the heart that weaken wisdom (cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkaraṇe), having their thoughts well established in the four foundations of mindfulness (catusu satipatthānesu supatitthitacitta), and having developed in their real essence the seven factors of wisdom (satta bojjhange yathābhūtam bhāvetvā).2"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> A II 157: ... samathapubbangamam vipassanam bhāvayato maggo sañjāyati (= A-a III 143: samathapubbangamanti samatham pubbangamam purecārikam katvā. Maggo sañjāyatīti paṭhamo lokuttaramaggo nibbattati ...).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> A V 194–95: Seyyathāpi, āvuso uttiya, rañño paccantimam nagaram daļhuddhāpam daļhapākāratoraṇam ekadvāram. Tatrassa dovāriko paṇḍito byatto medhāvī aññātānam nivāretā ñātānam pavesetā. So tassa nagarassa samantā anupariyāyapatham anukkamati. Anupariyāyapatham anukkamamāno na passeyya pākārasandhim vā pākāravivaram vā, antamaso biļāranikhamanamattampi. No ca khvassa evam ñāṇam hoti: ettakā pāṇā imam nagaram pavisanti vā nikhamanti vā'ti. Atha khvassa evamettha hoti: ye kho keci oļārikā pāṇā imam nagaram pavisanti vā nikhamanti vā, sabbe te iminā dvārena pavisanti vā nikhamanti vā'ti. Evamevam kho, āvuso uttiya, na tathāgatassa evam ussukkam hoti: sabbo vā tena loko nīyati, upaḍḍho vā, tibhāgo vā'ti. Atha kho evamettha tathāgatassa hoti: ye kho keci lokamhā nīyimsu vā nīyanti vā nīyissanti vā, sabbe te pañca nīvaraṇe pahāya cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkaraṇe, catūsu satipaṭṭhānesu suppatithitacittā, satta bojjhange yathābhūūtam bhāvetvā. Evamete lokamhā nīyimsu vā nīyanti vā nīyissanti vā ti.

(2) Emphasising as it were this statement of the Venerable Ānanda Thera, the Venerable Sāriputta Thera tells the Buddha in the Sampasadaniya Sutta<sup>3</sup> that he knows, through the knowledge

that is in conformity with the Dhamma, that all the Supremely Enlightened Ones of the past, future, and present, all of them realise supreme enlightenment by getting rid of the five hindrances, those impurities of the heart that weaken wisdom, having their thoughts well established in the four foundations of mindfulness, and having developed in their real essence the seven factors of wisdom.

(3) Again the Venerable Sāriputta Thera tells the Buddha the same thing in the Satipaṭṭhāna Saṃyutta. $^4$ 

In both these instances the Buddha commended the Venerable Sāriputta Thera and exhorted him to repeat this teaching again and again to monks, nuns, men and women lay disciples; so that should there be among them any foolish people who may have doubt and perplexity regarding the teaching, they might give up their doubt and perplexity.

(4) Finally in the Mahā-Parinibbāna Sutta⁵ the Venerable Sāriputta Thera, shortly before he and the Buddha passed away, made this same declaration.

The Nibbāna of the Buddha, the Pacceka Buddha, and the Arahat, is the same, and so the method of its attainment is the same. There is no exception. This fact is confirmed by the Buddha in the Mahāsaccaka Sutta and elsewhere.<sup>6</sup> Having attained to the Sphere of Nothingness (*akincanriayatana*) under his first teacher, Ālāra Kālāma, and to the Sphere of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> D III 101: Seyyathāpi, bhante, rañño paccantimam nagaram daļhuddhāpam, 03 daļhapākāratoraņam ekadvāram. Tatrassa dovāriko pandito byatto medhāvī aññātānam nivāretā, ñātānam pavesetā. So tassa nagarassa samantā anupariyāyapatham anukkamamāno na passeyya pākārasandhim vā pākāravivaram vā antamaso bilāranikkhamanamattampi. Tassa evamassa— 'ye kho keci olārikā pānā imam nagaram pavisanti vā nikkhamanti vā, sabbe te imināva dvārena pavisanti vā nikkhamanti vā'ti. Evameva kho me, bhante, dhammanvayo vidito. Ye te, bhante, ahesum atītamaddhānam arahanto sammāsambuddhā, sabbe te bhagavanto pañca nīvaraņe pahāya cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkaraņe catūsu satipaṭṭhānesu suppatiṭṭhitacittā, satta sambojjhange yathābhūtam bhāvetvā anuttaram sammāsambodhim abhisambujjhimsu. Yepi te, bhante, bhavissanti anagatamaddhanam arahanto sammasambuddha, sabbe te bhagavanto pañca nīvarane pahaya cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkaraņe catūsu satipaṭṭhānesu suppatiṭṭhitacittā, satta sambojjhange yathābhūtam bhāvetvā anuttaram sammāsambodhim abhisambujjhissanti. Bhagavāpi, bhante, etarahi araham sammāsambuddho pañca nīvaraņe pahāya cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkaraņe catūsu satipaṭṭhānesu suppatiţţhitacittosatta sambojjhange yathābhūtam bhāvetvā anuttaram sammāsambodhim abhisambuddho. <sup>4</sup> S V 160–61: Yepi te bhante ahesum atītamaddhānam arahanto sammāsambuddhā, sabbe te bhagavanto pañca nīvaraņe pahāya, cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkaraņe, catūsu satipaṭṭhānesu suppatiṭṭhitacittā, satta bojjhange yathābhūtam bhāvetvā, anuttaram sammāsambodhim abhisambujjhimsu. Yepi te, bhante, bhavissanti anāgatamaddhānam arahanto sammāsambuddhā, sabbe te bhagavanto pañca nīvaraņe pahāya, cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkarane, catūsu satipaṭṭhānesu suppatiṭṭhitacittā, satta bojjhange yathābhūtam bhāvetvā, anuttaram sammāsambodhim abhisambujjhissanti. Bhagavāpi, bhante, etarahi araham sammāsambuddho pañca nīvaraņe pahāya, cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkaraņe, catūsu satipaṭṭhānesu suppatiṭṭhitacitto, satta bojjhange yathābhūtam bhāvetvā, anuttaram sammāsambodhim abhisambuddho ti. Sādhu sādhu, sāriputta! Tasmātiha tvam, sāriputta, imam dhammapariyāyam abhikkhanam bhāseyyāsi bhikkhūnam bhikkhunīnam upāsakānam upāsikānam. Yesampi hi, sāriputta, moghapurisānam bhavissati tathāgate kankhā vā vimati vā, tesampimam dhammapariyāyam sutvā yā tathāgate kankhā vā vimati vā sā pahīyissatī ti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> D II 83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> M I 237.

neither perception nor non-perception (nevasannanasannayatana) under his second teacher, Uddaka Rāmaputta, the Bodhisatta undertook the practice of the most austere forms of meditation and asceticism. He practised the not-breathing meditation (appanaka jhāna). This only brought him great physical pain; though his mind was unshaken, he did not attain to his goal. Therefore, giving it up, he began the ascetic practice of not eating. He developed this to its utmost severity, but in the end had to confess that still he had not found what he sought. At this stage he asked himself: Could there be another way to enlightenment? It struck him then that as a child, while his father was engaged in the ploughing festival, seated in the cool shade of the purple berry tree, aloof from sense desires, aloof from evil states of mind, he attained the first meditation (paṭhamajjhāna) which is with initial and sustained application of thought, joy, and ease born of detachment. On considering further: Could this be the way to enlightenment? He came to the conclusion: This indeed is the way to enlightenment.

Since he was too weak to do anything immediately, having rested and taken nourishment, he developed the first meditation (*jhāna*) and so on up to the fourth (*jhāna*). With this as basis he attained to the knowledge of remembering (his) past lives (*pubbenivasanussatinana*), to the knowledge of the passing away and rebirth of beings (*sattaanatn cutupapate ñāṇa*), and lastly to the knowledge of the destruction of the cankers (*āsavakkhaya ñāṇa*).<sup>7</sup>

Now it will be seen that the not-breathing meditation (appanaka jhāna) practice yielded nothing but severe physical pain, whereas with the first meditation (paṭhamajjhāna) he was able to replace the hindrances with the meditation factors.<sup>8</sup> Here it is well to note that the Bodhisatta put away the five hindrances by developing the first meditation, and not by any other means. Shortly after his enlightenment the Buddha came to the conclusion under the Goatherd's Banyan that the sole way to the purification of beings is the practice of the four foundations of mindfulness.<sup>9</sup> And the four foundations of mindfulness begin with a serenity (samatha) subject of meditation, namely, mindfulness of in-breathing and outbreathing (ānāpānasati).

Here, too, the statements of the Venerable Sāriputta Thera and of the Venerable Ānanda Thera are confirmed by the Buddha's own experience in respect of the getting rid of the five hindrances and of the development of the four foundations of mindfulness.

In the following Sutta the Buddha shows that his followers, too, attain enlightenment in just the same way as he did under the bodhi tree, namely, by way of the meditations (*jhānas*). Here in the simile of the celestial tree he describes in brief the progress of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> M I 246: ... siyā nu kho añño maggo bodhāyā ti? Tassa mayhaṃ, aggivessana, etadahosi— 'abhijānāmi kho panāhaṃ pitu sakkassa kammante sītāya jambucchāyāya nisinno vivicceva kāmehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi savitakkaṃ savicāraṃ vivekajaṃ pītisukhaṃ paṭhamaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharitā. siyā nu kho eso maggo bodhāyā ti? Tassa mayhaṃ, aggivessana, satānusāri viññāṇaṃahosi—eseva maggo bodhāyā ti.

 $<sup>^8</sup>$  M I 295: Paṭhamaṃ kho, āvuso, jhānaṃ evaṃ pañcaṅgavippahīnaṃ pañcaṅgasamannāgatan-ti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> S V 185.

disciple of the noble (*ariyāsavaka*) from the time he thinks of leaving home for homelessness up to the time he destroys the cankers as a Consummate One.

He says:

- (1) At which time the disciple of the noble thinks of leaving home for homelessness he is like the withered leaf of the celestial tree of the Tavatimsa devas.
- (2) At which time the disciple of the noble, having cut hair and beard, dons orange robes, and goes from home to homelessness, he is like the fallen leaves the celestial tree of the Tayatimsa devas.
- (3) At which time the disciple of the noble, aloof from sense-desires ... enters and abides in the first meditation (*paṭhamaṃ jhānam*), he is like the celestial tree in bud.
- (4) At which time the disciple of the noble, by the subsidence of applied and sustained thought ... enters and abides in the second meditation (*dutiyam jhānam*), he is like the sharp buds of the celestial tree of the Tavatimsa devas.
- (5) At which time the disciple of the noble, with the fading away of joy ... enters and abides in the third meditation (*tatiyam jhānam*) he is like the opening buds of the celestial tree of the Tavatimsa devas.
- (6) At which time the disciple of the noble, having put away ease ... and enters and abides in the fourth (*catuttham jhānam*), he is like the red lotus-like flowers of the celestial tree of the Tavatimsa devas.
- (7) At which time the disciple of the noble, having destroyed the cankers ... enters and abides in the realisation (of freedom), he is like the celestial tree of the Tavatimsa devas in full blossom<sup>10</sup>.

<sup>10</sup> A IV 118–19: "Evamevam kho, bhikkhave, yasmim samaye ariyasāvako agārasmā anagāriyam pabbajjāya ceteti, pandupalāso, bhikkhave, ariyasāvako tasmim samaye hoti devānamva tāvatimsānam pāricchattako koviļāro. "Yasmim, bhikkhave, samaye ariyasāvako kesamassum ohāretvā kāsāyāni vatthāni acchādetvā agārasmā anagāriyam pabbajito hoti, pannapalāso, bhikkhave, ariyasāvako tasmim samaye hoti devānamva tāvatiṃsānaṃ pāricchattako koviļāro. "Yasmiṃ, bhikkhave, samaye ariyasāvako vivicceva kāmehi ...pe... paṭhamaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharati, jālakajāto, bhikkhave, ariyasāvako tasmiṃ samaye hoti devānaṃva tāvatimsānam pāricchattako kovilāro. "Yasmim, bhikkhave, samaye ariyasāvako vitakkavicārānam vūpasamā ... pe... dutiyam jhānam upasampajja viharati, khārakajāto, bhikkhave, ariyasāvako tasmim samaye hoti devānamva tāvatimsānam pāricchattako koviļāro. "Yasmim, bhikkhave, samaye ariyasāvako pītiyā ca virāgā ... pe... tatiyam jhānam upasampajja viharati, kuṭumalakajāto, bhikkhave, ariyasāvako tasmim samaye hoti devānamva tāvatimsānam pāricchattako koviļāro. "Yasmim, bhikkhave, samaye ariyasāvako sukhassa ca pahānā dukkhassa ca pahānā ...pe... catuttham jhānam upasampajja viharati, korakajāto, bhikkhave, ariyasāvako tasmim samaye hoti devānamva tāvatimsānam pāricchattako koviļāro. "Yasmim, bhikkhave, samaye ariyasāvako āsavānam khayā ...pe... sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati, sabbaphāliphullo, bhikkhave, ariyasāvako tasmim samaye hoti devānamva tāvatimsānam pāricchattako koviļāro. "Tasmim, bhikkhave, samaye bhummā devā saddamanussāventi- 'eso itthannāmo āyasmā itthannāmassa āyasmato saddhivihāriko amukamhā gāmā vā nigamā vā agārasmā anagāriyam pabbajito āsavānam khayā anāsavam cetovimuttim paññāvimuttim diṭṭheva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharatī'ti. Bhummānam devānam saddam sutvā cātumahārājikā devā ...pe... tāvatiṃsā devā... yāmā devā... tusitā devā... nimmānaratī devā... paranimmitavasavattī devā... brahmakāyikā devā saddamanussāventi- 'eso itthannāmo āyasmā itthannāmassa āyasmato saddhivihāriko amukamhā gāmā vā nigamā vā agārasmā anagāriyam pabbajito āsavānam khayā anāsavam cetovimuttim paññāvimuttim diṭṭheva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharatī'ti. Itiha tena khanena tenamuhuttena yava brahmaloka saddo abbhuggacchati, ayamanubhavo khinasavassa bhikkhuno"ti.

Another thing that is evident from these experiences of the Buddha is that meditation ( $jh\bar{a}na$ ) taught in the Dhamma is not the same as those that are taught outside it. The not-breathing meditation ( $app\bar{a}naka\ jh\bar{a}na$ ) was not capable of removing the hindrances .

Meditation (jhāna) may vary in strength according to the individual. In an unskilful beginner, as illustrated in the simile of the foolish mountain cow<sup>11</sup> it is very weak; so weak that one is not able to repeat it. This cow thinks of going to where it had not been before, eating grass it had never eaten before, and drinking water it had not drunk before. And in trying to do it it raises its hind foot before establishing itself firmly on its fore leg. Thus it is neither able to get to the place it had not been before, nor eat the grass it had not eaten before, nor drink the water it had not drunk before. Nor is it able to return to where it was before. Just so is it when a foolish unskilful monk, aloof from sense-desires, aloof from evil states of mind attains to the first meditation (jhāna) which is with initial and sustained application of thought, joy, and ease born of detachment; but he does not pursue, develop, or cultivate that sign and establish it well. In spite of it this foolish, unskilful monk attempts to attain the second meditation by the subsidence of applied and sustained thought, and fails, because he does not know how to do it. Then, trying to re-enter the first meditation he fails in this too. He is called one who has fallen in both ways, one who has deteriorated in both ways. In short, he gained the first meditation once, neglected to gain facility in reentering it, and so lost it altogether. The Buddha goes on to say that only if one pursues, develops, and cultivates the first meditation is it possible for him to attain to the second meditation and so forth.

This Sutta shows the possibility of one attaining the first meditation, and thereby to the temporary abandonment of the five hindrances, and also the possibility of falling away from it due to negligence. There is also the third possibility of gaining facility in the practice of meditation. In the noble path (*ariyamagga*) meditation (*jhāna*) manifests itself as controlling faculty (*indriya*) power (*bala*) and right concentration (*sammāsamādhi*).<sup>12</sup>

The importance of meditation (*jhāna*) is further stressed in the following Sutta: "Monks, just as the clear cloud-free autumn sun rising in the sky, and dispersing all darkness from the heavens, fills it with splendour, shines forth, and illumines it, so, monks, there arises in the noble disciple the faultless, stainless eye of wisdom. Together with this arising, monks, three fetters of the noble disciple are put away: Belief in self, doubt, and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> AIV 418.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> S V 196: (a) kattha ca, bhikkhave, samādhindriyam daṭṭhabbam? catūsu jhānesu—ettha samādhindriyam daṭṭhabbam; (b) S V,198: Katamañca, bhikkhave, samādhindriyam? Idha, bhikkhave, ariyasāvako vossaggārammaṇam karitvā labhati samādhim, labhati cittassa ekaggatam—idam vuccati, bhikkhave, samādhindriyam. (c) S V 220: Evameva kho, bhikkhave, yam saddhindriyam tam saddhābalam, yam saddhābalam tam saddhindriyam; ... yam paññindriyam tam paññā-balam, yam paññābalam tam paññindriyam.

<sup>(</sup>d) A IV 4: Katamañca, bhikkhave, samādhibalam? Idha, bhikkhave, ariyasāvako vivicceva kāmehi ... catuttham jhānam upasampajja viharati. (e) A III, 12 Kattha ca, bhikkhave, samādhibalam daṭṭhabbam? Catūsu jhānesu. (f) D II 313: Katamo ca, bhikkhave, sammāsamādhi? Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu vivicceva kāmehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi savitakkam savicāram vivekajam pītisukhampathamam jhānam upasampajja viharati. ...

belief in rites and ceremonies. Further he quits two things: Covetousness and ill-will. Then, aloof from sense-desires, aloof from evil states of mind, he attains to, and abides in, the first meditation which is with initial and sustained application of thought, joy, and ease born of detachment. Should a noble disciple pass away at this time, there is no Fetter bound by which he would return to this world." The commentary says: "In this sutta the <code>jhāna-non-returner</code> (<code>jhānanāgāmi</code>) is spoken of"

Further the Buddha says: "Just as the Ganges flows, slopes, inclines to the east, just so does a monk, by developing and practising the four meditations (*jhāna*), flow, slope, and incline to Nibbāna.<sup>13</sup>"

Thus the work he began as a commoner with the temporary abandonment of the five hindrances, which now as a Consummate One he completely destroys with the attainment of the five aggregates of the learning-ender (*asekha*), that is to say, virtue, concentration, wisdom, freedom, and the knowledge and vision of that freedom<sup>14</sup> is in no small measure due to meditation (*jhāna*).

Meditation (*jhāna*) is therefore essential to the journey from here to the other shore. It is not to be treated lightly with sweeping statements like "It is found in outside (*bahira*) teachings, too, and so is not important." We have seen how the Bodhisatta rejected the meditation taught by his former teachers who were outsiders (*bahiraka*), and the not-breathing meditation which, too, is an outside teaching, to follow the first meditation (*jhāna*) which finally led him to supreme enlightenment. Just as *kamma*, *araha*, *nibbāna* and so on are not quite the same as those taught in other teachings which use these same words, so is meditation (*jhāna*) in the Dhamma different from meditation (*jhāna*), taught elsewhere. They are not identical.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> A I 242: Seyyathāpi, bhikkhave, saradasamaye viddhe vigatavalāhake deve ādicco nabham abbhussakkamāno sabbam ākāsagatam tamagatam abhivihacca bhāsate ca tapate ca virocati ca. "Evamevam kho, bhikkhave, yato ariyasāvakassa virajam vītamalam dhammacakkhum uppajjati saha dassanuppādā, bhikkhave, ariyasāvakassa tīni samyojanāni pahīyanti sakkāyadiṭṭhi, vicikicchā, sīlabbataparāmāso. Athāparam dvīhi dhammehi niyyāti abhijjhāya ca byāpādena ca. So vivicceva kāmehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi savitakkam savicāram vivekajam pītisukham paṭhamam jhānam upasampajja viharati. Tasmim ce, bhikkhave, samaye ariyasāvako kālam kareyya, natthi tam saṃyojanam yena saṃyojanena saṃyutto ariyasāvako puna imam lokam āgaccheyyā ti (= A-a II 356: imasmim hi sutte jhānānāgāmī nāma kathito ti).

<sup>2. (</sup>a) S V 307–8: Pañcimāni, bhikkhave, uddhambhāgiyāni saṃyojanāni. Katamāni pañca? Rūparāgo, arūparāgo, māno, uddhaccaṃ, avijjā— imāni kho, bhikkhave, pañcuddhambhāgiyāni saṃyojanāni. Imesaṃ kho, bhikkhave, pañcannaṃ uddhambhāgiyānaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ abhiñnāya pariñnāya parikhayāya pahānāya cattāro jhānā bhāvetabbā. Katame cattāro? Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu vivicceva kāmehi ...

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> (a) A V 16: Pañcangavippahīno, bhikkhave, bhikkhu pañcangasamannāgato imasmim dhammavinaye 'kevalī vusitavā uttamapuriso'ti vuccati. Kathañca, bhikkhave, bhikkhu pañcangavippahīno hoti? Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhuno kāmacchando pahīno hoti, byāpādo pahīno hoti, thinamiddham pahīnam hoti, uddhaccakukkuccam pahīnam hoti, vicikicchā pahīnā hoti. Evam kho, bhikkhave, bhikkhu pañcangavippahīno hoti. Kathañca, bhikkhave, bhikkhu pañcangasamannāgato hoti? Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu asekhena sīlakkhandhena samannāgato hoti, asekhena vimuttikkhandhena samannāgato hoti, asekhena vimuttikkhandhena samannāgato hoti, asekhena vimuttikkhandhena samannāgato hoti. Evam kho, bhikkhave, bhikkhu pañcangasamannāgato hoti.

Now let us consider the process of passing over from the plane of the commoner (puthujjanabhūmi) to that of the Noble Ones (ariyabhūmi); in other words the last acts of the practiser as a commoner and his first acts as a Noble One (ariya). This is very clearly, forcefully, and succinctly stated, shorn of all complexities that tend to becloud the eye of understanding, in the Okkantika Samyutta.<sup>15</sup> At this stage the commoner needs, in addition to virtue (sīla) and the abandonment of the five hindrances (pañcanivaraṇa pahāna) previously attained, either faith (saddhā), or wisdom (pañāā), to an extent (mattaso), as the case may be, according to the character of the individual. The eye, ear, nose, tongue body, and mind are impermanent, changeable, and fickle. One who has faith in this teaching, and is firmly resolved in it, is called faith-striver (saddhānusari). He has entered the right path (sammattaniyāma), entered the plane of the worthy (sappurisabhūmi), having transcended the plane of the commoner (puthujjanabhūmi). One who with wisdom finds pleasure to an extent in these teachings, is called dhamma-striver a (dhammanusari). He, too, has entered the right path, entered the plane of the worthy, having transcended the plane of the commoner.

Both these individuals are incapable of doing any action which will result in rebirth in hell, in the animal world, and in the realm of the manes. They are also incapable of passing away without realising the fruit of Stream-Entrance (*sotāpattiphala*). He who knows and sees these teachings thus is called Stream-Entrant and is not liable to sink into evil states of existence, but is certain of proceeding towards enlightenment.

What is briefly expressed in this last sentence is taught in greater detail in another Sutta of the Saṃyutta Nikāya. <sup>16</sup> There the Buddha describes the following six persons: (1)

sambodhiparāyanoti. Ayampi kho, mahānāma, puggalo parimutto nirayā parimutto tiracchānayoniyā

 $<sup>^{15}</sup>$  S III 225: Cakkhuṃ, bhikkhave, aniccaṃ vipariṇāmi aññathābhāvi; sotaṃ aniccaṃ vipariṇāmi aññathābhāvi; ghānam aniccam viparināmi aññathābhāvi; jivhā aniccā viparināmī aññathābhāvī; kāyo anicco viparināmī aññathābhāvī; mano anicco viparināmī aññathābhāvī. Yo, bhikkhave, ime dhamme evam saddahati adhimuccati, ayam vuccati saddhānusārī, okkanto sammattaniyāmam, sappurisabhūmim okkanto, vītivatto puthujjanabhūmim; abhabbo tam kammam kātum, yam kammam katvā nirayam vā tiracchānayonim vā pettivisayam vā upapajjeyya; abhabbo ca tāva kālam kātum yāva na sotāpattiphalam sacchikaroti. 16 (a) SV 376: Idha, mahānāma, ekacco puggalo buddhe aveccappasādena samannāgato hoti – itipi so bhagavā... pe... satthā devamanussānam buddho bhagavāti. Dhamme...pe... sanghe...pe... hāsapañño javanapañño vimuttiyā ca samannāgato. So āsavānam khayā anāsavam cetovimuttim paññāvimuttim diṭṭheva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati. Ayampi kho, mahānāma, puggalo parimutto nirayā parimutto tiracchānayoniyā parimutto pettivisayā parimutto apāyaduggativinipātā. Idha pana, mahānāma, ekacco puggalo buddhe aveccappasādena samannāgato hoti – itipi so bhagavā...pe... satthā devamanussānam buddho bhagavāti. Dhamme...pe... sanghe...pe... hāsapañño javanapañño na ca vimuttiyā samannāgato. So pañcannam orambhāgiyānam samyojanānam parikkhayā opapātiko hoti tattha parinibbāyī anāvattidhammo asmā lokā. Ayampi kho, mahānāma, puggalo parimutto nirayā parimutto tiracchānayoniyā parimutto pettivisayā parimutto apāyaduggativinipātā. Idha pana, mahānāma, ekacco puggalo buddhe aveccappasādena samannāgato hoti – itipi so bhagavā...pe... satthā devamanussānam buddho bhagavāti. Dhamme...pe... saṅghe...pe... na hāsapañño na javanapañño na ca vimuttiyā samannāgato. So tiņņam samyojanānam parikkhayā rāgadosamohānam tanuttā sakadāgāmī hoti, sakideva imam lokam āgantvā dukkhassantam karoti. Ayampi kho, mahānāma, puggalo parimutto nirayā parimutto tiracchānayoniyā parimutto pettivisayā parimutto apāyaduggativinipātā. Idha pana, mahānāma, ekacco puggalo buddhe aveccappasādena samannāgato hoti – itipi so bhagavā...pe... satthā devamanussānam buddho bhagavāti; dhamme...pe... sanghe...pe... na hāsapañño na javanapañño na ca vimuttiyā samannāgato. So tinnam samyojanānam parikkhayā sotāpanno hoti avinipātadhammo niyato

The Consummate One who, is possessed of intelligent faith in the Buddha, (buddhe aveccappasadena samannāgato) the Dhamma, and the Sangha: is possessed of joyous wit, quick wit and freedom; and having destroyed the cankers is mind-freed (cetovimutta), wisdomfreed (paññāvimutta), and freed (parimutta) from rebirth in the four evil states of existence; (2) the Non-Returner who, is possessed of the first five qualities mentioned above but is not possessed of freedom, has destroyed the five lower fetters, will be reborn spontaneously in the pure abodes attaining parinibbana there, and is freed (parimutta) from rebirth in the four evil states of existence; (3) the Once-Returner who, is possessed of the first three qualities but not the last three, has destroyed three fetters and reduced lust, hate and ignorance, returns once more to this world and accomplishes the destruction of ill, and is freed (parimutta) from rebirth in the four evil states of existence; (4) the Stream-Entrant who, is possessed of the first three qualities but not of the last three, has destroyed three fetters, is assured of going through to enlightenment, and is freed (parimutta) from rebirth in the four evil states of existence; (5) the dhamma-striver, who though he is not possessed even of intelligent faith in the Buddha, the Dhamma, and the Sangha, (na heva kho Buddhe aveccappasadena samannagato hotI na dhamme na sanghe) nor is possessed of joyous wit, quick wit, and freedom, yet has the controlling faculties of faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration, and wisdom; he is one who

parimutto pettivisayā parimutto apāyaduggativinipātā.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Idha pana, mahānāma, ekacco puggalo na heva kho buddhe aveccappasādena samannāgato hoti... na dhamme...pe... na saṅghe...pe... na hāsapañño na javanapañño na ca vimuttiyā samannāgato. Api cassa ime dhammā honti — saddhindriyam, vīriyindriyam, satindriyam, samādhindriyam, paññindriyam.

Tathāgatappaveditā cassa dhammā paññāya mattaso nijjhānam khamanti. Ayampi kho, mahānāma, puggalo agantā nirayam agantā tiracchānayonim agantā pettivisayam agantā apāyam duggatim vinipātam.

Idha pana, mahānāma, ekacco puggalo na heva kho buddhe aveccappasādena samannāgato hoti... na dhamme... pe... na saṅghe...pe... na hāsapañño na javanapañño na ca vimuttiyā samannāgato, api cassa ime dhammā honti saddhindriyam...pe... paññindriyam. Tathāgate cassa saddhāmattam hoti pemamattam. Ayampi kho, mahānāma, puggalo agantā nirayam agantā tiracchānayonim agantā pettivisayam agantā apāyam duggatim vinipātam.

<sup>(</sup>b) D III 227/Dialogues III218 Cattāri sotāpattiyangāni – sappurisasaṃsevo, saddhammassavanaṃ, yonisomanasikāro, dhammānudhammappaṭipatti.

<sup>&</sup>quot;Cattāri sotāpannassa aṅgāni. Idhāvuso, ariyasāvako buddhe aveccappasādena samannāgato hoti — 'itipi so bhagavā arahaṃ sammāsambuddho vijjācaraṇasampanno sugato lokavidū anuttaro purisadammasārathi satthā devamanussānaṃ buddho, bhagavā'ti. Dhamme aveccappasādena samannāgato hoti — 'svākkhāto bhagavatā dhammo sandiṭṭhiko akāliko ehipassiko opaneyyiko paccattaṃ veditabbo viññūhī'ti. Saṅghe aveccappasādena samannāgato hoti — 'suppaṭipanno bhagavato sāvakasaṅgho ujuppaṭipanno bhagavato sāvakasaṅgho ñāyappaṭipanno bhagavato sāvakasaṅgho sāmīcippaṭipanno bhagavato sāvakasaṅgho yadidaṃ cattāri purisayugāni aṭṭha purisapuggalā, esa bhagavato sāvakasaṅgho āhuneyyo pāhuneyyo dakkhiṇeyyo añjalikaraṇīyo anuttaraṃ puññakkhettaṃ lokassā'ti. Ariyakantehi sīlehi samannāgato hoti akhaṇḍehi acchiddehi asabalehi akammāsehi bhujissehi viññuppasatthehi aparāmaṭṭhehi samādhisaṃvattanikehi.

(c) S V 404 (Kindred Sayings V345: (I) Cattārimāni, bhikkhave, sotāpattiyaṅgāni. Katamāni cattāri? Sappurisasaṃsevo, saddhammassavanaṃ, yonisomanasikāro, dhammānudhammappaṭipatti — imāni kho, bhikkhave, cattāri sotāpattiyaṅgānī ti

<sup>(</sup>d) S II 68 (Kindred Sayings II 481: (2) *Yato kho, gahapati, ariyasāvakassa pañca bhayāni verāni vūpasantāni honti, catūhi ca sotāpattiyangehi samannāgato hoti...* 

<sup>(</sup>Sotāpattiyaṅgehīti duvidhaṃ sotāpattiyā aṅgaṃ, yaṃ pubbabhāge sotāpattipaṭilābhāya saṃvattati, ''sappurisasaṃsevo saddhammassavanaṃ yonisomanasikāro dhammānudhammappaṭipattī''ti (dī. ni. 3.311) evaṃ āgataṃ, paṭiladdhaguṇassa ca sotāpattiṃ patvā ṭhitassa aṅgaṃ, yaṃ sotāpannassa aṅgantipi vuccati, buddhe aveccappasādādīnaṃ etaṃ adhivacanaṃ. S-a II 72)

with wisdom finds pleasure to an extent in the teachings proclaimed by the Tathāgata. Even he shall not go (*aganta*) to the four evil states of existence; (6) the faith-striver who though he is not possessed even of intelligent faith in the Buddha, the Dhamma, and the Sangha, nor is possessed of joyous wit, quick wit, and freedom, yet has the five controlling faculties of faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration, and wisdom; he has only mere faith in, and mere affection for, the teachings proclaimed by the Tathāgata. Even he, too, shall not go (*aganta*) to the four evil states of existence.

It will be seen that the last two persons mentioned above, the dhamma-striver, and the faith-striver, unlike the Consummate One, the Non-Returner, the Once-Returner, and the Stream-Entrant, have not even intelligent faith in the Three Jewels (*tiratana*), and are without joyous wit and quick wit. They are not freed (*parimutta*) from, but shall not go (*aganta*) to, the four evil states of existence. This is because they are Noble Ones (*ariya*) who have but just left the plane of the commoner (*puthujjanabhūmi*), and have work to do with diligence (*appamadena karaniyam*) before attaining the fruit of Stream-Entrance (*sotāpattiphala*), the attainment of which alone assures freedom from these four evil states of rebirth. It takes place in this very life, the latest being at death.

These two path-attainers (*magga-lābhi*) are likened to a tender calf just born. The Buddha says that long ago there was a prudent neat-herd of Magadha. In the last month of the rainy season, having examined the hither bank of the Ganges he made his herd to cross over at a ford to Vedeha on the thither bank. First he had the sires, the leaders, cross over in safety to the thither bank; then the sturdy bulls and young steers who also crossed to the thither bank in safety; next the young bulls and young cows, and they too crossed to the thither bank in safety; following them came the lean and weaker calves who also crossed over to the thither bank in safety. And on that occasion, long ago, there was a tender calf born just then, which also cut across the stream drawn by its mother's mooing. The Buddha likens the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver to that tender calf, which though born just then was able to cut across the stream and reach the thither bank in safety.<sup>17</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> M I 225: Bhūtapubbam, bhikkhave, māgadhako gopālako sappaññajātiko, vassānam pacchime māse saradasamaye, samavekkhitvā gangāya nadiyā orimam tīram, samavekkhitvā pārimam tīram, tittheneva gāvo patāresi uttaram tīram suvidehānam. So pathamam patāresi ye te usabhā gopitaro goparināyakā. Te tiriyam gangāya sotam chetvā sotthinā pāram agamamsu. Athāpare patāresi balavagāvo dammagāvo. Tepi tiriyam gangāya sotam chetvā sotthinā pāram agamamsu. Athāpare patāresi vacchatare vacchatariyo. Tepi tiriyam gangāya sotam chetvā sotthinā pāram agamamsu. Athāpare patāresi vacchake kisābalake. Tepi tiriyam gangāya sotam chetvā sotthinā pāram agamamsu. Bhūtapubbam, bhikkhave, vacchako tarunako tāvadeva jātako mātugoravakena vuyhamāno, sopi tiriyam gangāya sotam chetvā sotthinā pāram agamāsi. Tam kissa hetu? Tathā hi so, bhikkhave, māgadhako gopālako sappaññajātiko, vassānam pacchime māse saradasamaye, samavekkhitvā gangāya nadiyā orimam tīram, samavekkhitvā pārimam tīram, tittheneva gāvo patāresi uttaram tīram suvidehānam. Evameva kho, bhikkhave, ye hi keci samaņā vā brāhmaņā vā kusalā imassa lokassa kusalā parassa lokassa, kusalā māradheyyassa kusalā amāradheyyassa, kusalā maccudheyyassa kusalā amaccudheyyassa, tesam ye sotabbam saddahātabbam maññissanti, tesam tam bhavissati dīgharattam hitāya sukhāya. Seyyathāpi, bhikkhave, ye te usabhā gopitaro goparināyakā te tiriyam gangāya sotam chetvā sotthinā pāram agamamsu, evameva kho, bhikkhave, ye te bhikkhū arahanto khīnāsavā vusitavanto katakaranīyā ohitabhārā anuppattasadatthā parikkhīṇabhavasaṃyojanā sammadaññā vimuttā, te tiriyaṃ mārassa sotaṃ chetvā sotthinā pāram gatā. Seyyathāpi te, bhikkhave, balavagāvo dammagāvo tiriyam gangāya sotam chetvā

As such work has just begun for the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver, they have much to do yet. And this is stressed in the Kitagiri and other Suttas. There the Buddha says: I do not say of all monks that that they should act with diligence. Nor do I not say of all that they should not act with diligence. Those monks who are Consummate Ones, who have destroyed the cankers (*khināsava*), perfected (*vusitava*), done what had to be done (*katakaraniya*) laid down the burden (*ohitabhara*), won to the goal (*anuppattasadattha*), destroyed the fetters of the states of existence (*parikkhinabhāvāsaṃyojana*), are freed by utmost knowledge (*samma-d-annavimutta*), of such monks as these I do not say that they should act with diligence. What is the reason? They have acted with diligence, and so are incapable of

sotthinā pāraṃ agamaṃsu, evameva kho, bhikkhave, ye te bhikkhū pañcannaṃ orambhāgiyānaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhayā opapātikā tattha parinibbāyino anāvattidhammā tasmā lokā, tepi tiriyaṃ mārassa sotaṃ chetvā sotthinā pāraṃ gamissanti. Seyyathāpi te, bhikkhave, vacchatarā vacchatariyo tiriyaṃ gaṅgāya sotaṃ chetvā sotthinā pāraṃ agamaṃsu, evameva kho, bhikkhave, ye te bhikkhū tiṇṇaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhayā rāgadosamohānaṃ tanuttā sakadāgāmino sakiṃdeva imaṃ lokaṃ āgantvā dukkhassantaṃ karissanti, tepi tiriyaṃ mārassa sotaṃ chetvā sotthinā pāraṃ gamissanti. "Seyyathāpi te, bhikkhave, vacchakā kisābalakā tiriyaṃ gaṅgāya sotaṃ chetvā sotthinā pāraṃ agamaṃsu, evameva kho, bhikkhave, ye te bhikkhū tiṇṇaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ parikkhayā sotāpannā avinipātadhammā niyatā sambodhiparāyanā, tepi tiriyaṃ mārassa sotaṃ chetvā sotthinā pāraṃ gamissanti. Seyyathāpi so, bhikkhave, vacchako taruṇako tāvadeva jātako mātugoravakena vuyhamāno tiriyaṃ gaṅgāya sotaṃ chetvā sotthinā pāraṃ agamāsi, evameva kho, bhikkhave, ye te bhikkhū dhammānusārino saddhānusārino, tepi tiriyaṃ mārassa sotaṃ chetvā sotthinā pāraṃ gamissanti.

[8] M I 477: Sattime, bhikkhave, puggalā santo saṃvijjamānā lokasmiṃ. Katame satta? Ubhatobhāgavimutto, paññāvimutto, kāyasakkhi, diṭṭhippatto, saddhāvimutto, dhammānusārī, saddhānusārī.

<sup>(</sup>b) M-a III 187: Sattime, bhikkhave, puggalāti idha kiṃ dasseti? Yesaṃ appamādena karaṇīyaṃ natthi, te dve honti. Yesaṃ atthi, te pañcāti evaṃ sabbepi ime satta puggalā hontīti imamatthaṃ dasseti.

<sup>(</sup>c) M I 478–79: Katamo ca, bhikkhave, puggalo ditthippatto? Idha, bhikkhave, ekacco puggalo ye te santā vimokkhā atikkamma rūpe āruppā te na kāyena phusitvā viharati, paññāya cassa disvā ekacce āsavā parikkhīnā honti, tathāgatappaveditā cassa dhammā paññāya voditthā honti vocaritā. Ayam vuccati, bhikkhave, puggalo diṭṭhippatto. Imassapi kho ahaṃ, bhikkhave, bhikkhuno 'appamādena karaṇīya'nti vadāmi. Taṃ kissa hetu? Appeva nāma ayamāyasmā anulomikāni senāsanāni paţisevamāno kalyāṇamitte bhajamāno indriyāni samannānayamāno – yassatthāya kulaputtā sammadeva agārasmā anagāriyam pabbajanti tadanuttaram – brahmacariyapariyosānam diṭṭheva dhamme sayam abhiññā sacchikatvā upasampajja vihareyyāti! Imam kho aham, bhikkhave, imassa bhikkhuno appamādaphalam sampassamāno 'appamādena karanīya'ntntti vadāmi. "Katamo ca, bhikkhave, puggalo saddhāvimutto. Idha, bhikkhave, ekacco puggalo ye te santā vimokkhā atikkamma rūpe āruppā te na kāyena phusitvā viharati, paññāya cassa disvā ekacce āsavā parikkhīnā honti, tathāgate cassa saddhā niviṭṭhā hoti mūlajātā patiṭṭhitā. Ayam vuccati, bhikkhave, puggalo saddhāvimutto. . . . "Katamo ca, bhikkhave, puggalo dhammānusārī? Idha, bhikkhave, ekacco puggalo ye te santā vimokkhā atikkamma rūpe āruppā te na kāyena phusitvā viharati, paññāya cassa disvā ekacce āsavā parikkhīnā honti, tathāgatappaveditā cassa dhammā paññāya mattaso nijjhānam khamanti, api cassa ime dhammā honti, seyyathidam – saddhindriyam, vīriyindriyam, satindriyam, samādhindriyam, paññindriyam. Ayam vuccati, bhikkhave, puggalo dhammānusārī. ...

<sup>&</sup>quot;Katamo ca, bhikkhave, puggalo saddhānusārī? Idha, bhikkhave, ekacco puggalo ye te santā vimokkhā atikkamma rūpe āruppā te na kāyena phusitvā viharati, paññāya cassa disvā ekacce āsavā parikkhīṇā honti, tathāgate cassa saddhāmattaṃ hoti pemamattaṃ, api cassa ime dhammā honti, seyyathidaṃ – saddhindriyaṃ, vīriyindriyaṃ, satindriyaṃ, samādhindriyaṃ, paññindriyaṃ. Ayaṃ vuccati, bhikkhave, puggalo saddhānusārī. ... 'appamādena karaṇīya'ntntti vadāmi.

<sup>(</sup>d) S IV 124 Ye ca kho te, bhikkhave, bhikkhū sekkhā appattamānasā anuttaraṃ yogakkhemaṃ patthayamānā viharanti, tesāhaṃ, bhikkhave, bhikkhūnaṃ chasu phassāyatanesu appamādena karaṇīyanti vadāmi.
(e) M I 9 So idaí dukkha 'nti yoniso manasi karoti, 'ayaí dukkhasamudayo' ti yoniso manasi karoti, 'ayaí dukkhanirodho' ti yoniso manasi karoti, 'ayaí dukkhanirodhagáminì paþipadá' ti yoniso manasi karoti. Tassa evaí yoniso manasikaroto tìòi saíyojanáni pahìyanti – sakkáyadiþþhi, vicikicchá, sìlabbataparámáso. Ime vuccanti, bhikkhave, ásavá dassaná pahátabbá.

negligence. But of such monks who are learners (*sekha*), having not attained to perfection, yet wishing to attain to the incomparable and uttermost security, I say that they have to act with diligence. What is the reason? Seeing that these venerable ones, while resorting to suitable dwellings, associating with good friends, controlling the faculties of sense, will realise, here and now, that fruit of diligence (*appamadaphalam*) for the sake of which young men of good family rightly go forth from home to homeless life, entering dwell in it.

The Buddha says further that there are seven persons: (1) freed in both ways, (2) wisdom-freed, (3) body-witness, (4) won to view, (5) faith-freed, (6) dhamma-striver, and (7) faith-striver. The first two, being Consummate Ones, the Buddha says that they have accomplished their work with diligence, and are incapable of negligence. This is because they have nothing more to do. But the remaining five, he says, need to be diligent. The third, the fourth, and the fifth, besides other attainments, have by wisdom seen that some of the cankers have been exhausted (paññāya c' assa disva ekacce āsava parikkhina honti). But the sixth and the seventh, the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver, have, besides other things, seen by wisdom that the cankers are not exhausted (paññāya c' assa disva āsava aparikkhina honti). Now it will take time, more than one thought-moment, to note this very important fact on attaining the first path.

The commentary agreeing with the Sutta says: "Thus among those persons by whom work has to be done with diligence are the three learners who have attained the paths and the fruits (patividdhamaggaphalasekha). Resorting to suitable dwellings, associating with good friends, harmonising faith and the other controlling faculties, they gradually reach the consummate state (arahatta). Thus the meaning of the text concerning them is as they are. Finally the two who have attained to the path of Stream-Entrance (sotāpattimaggasamangino) as befitting that path resort to a suitable dwelling, associate with good friends, and bring faith and the other controlling faculties into harmony. By resorting to (suitable dwellings), associating with (good friends), and harmonising (the controlling faculties) for the sake of attaining the three higher paths, they will gradually reach the consummate state.

Here it will be noted that "the two who have attained to the path of Stream-Entrance, are said to be "attaining the higher paths," thus skipping the immediately following fruit, which is the fruit of Stream-Entrance (sotāpattiphala). This will be discussed at length later. The commentary continues: "the disputant (vitandavādi) taking this very text says that the supramundane path does not consist of one thought-moment but of many thought-moments. He is one who should be told: 'If when with one thought-moment he resorts to a dwelling, with another associates with good friends, with yet another harmonises the controlling faculties, and the path-thought is another, you say that the path consists not of one thought-moment but of many. This being so, he who resorts to a dwelling, sees blue-hued mountains and forest; hears the sounds of animals and birds; smells the scent of flowers, and fruit both big and small; drinking beverages tastes their flavour; and sitting and lying down contacts tangibles. Thus these should be composed of the fivefold consciousness

and the supramundane. Now if you accept this you quarrel with the Teacher. The fivefold consciousness group is said by the Teacher to be always indeterminate. That which is endowed with good and bad is rejected (since) the Supramundane path is always good."

"Therefore, saying, 'Renounce this talk,' he should be remonstrated with on it. If this declaration is not accepted, he should be dismissed saying, 'Go right early to the monastery and entering it partake of some rice-gruel.<sup>19</sup>"

Here the commentary attributes to the disputer (vitaṇḍavādī) the statement that the path does not consist of one thought-moment but of many; then forces him to admit that he is mistaken on the ground that he is quarelling with the Teacher (satthāra). Had the disputer been free to explain himself he would probably have requested the production of any sutta passage which teaches that the path consists of one thought-moment, as is usually done by the commentary in such cases. For instance, it says, "He should be told, 'cite the sutta.<sup>20</sup>" And this is said in connection with this very question: whether the path consists of one thought-moment or of many. In fact there is the Aṅguttara Sutta quoted at the beginning of this article where the Venerable Ānanda Thera says: "Here, friends, a monk develops insight preceded by serenity the path is born. He pursues that path, develops, and practises it. In him thus pursuing, developing, and practising that path, the fetters are put away, and the latencies cease.<sup>21</sup>"

The commentary thinks otherwise: "Insight preceded by serenity: Serenity going before, leading. The path is born—the first Supramundane path arises. He (pursues) that path—there is no pursuing and so on of the one thought-moment path; however while producing the second path and so on that is pursued, developed, and cultivated.<sup>22</sup>"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> M-a III 192 : Iti imesu appamādena karaṇīyesu puggalesu tayo paṭividdhamaggaphalā sekhā. Tesu anulomasenāsanam sevamānā kalyāṇamitte bhajamānā indriyāni samannānayamānā anupubbena arahattam gaṇhanti. Tasmā tesaṃ yathāṭhitova pāḷiattho. Avasāne pana dve sotāpattimaggasamangino. Tehi tassa maggassa anulomasenāsanaṃ sevitaṃ, kalyāṇamittā bhajitā, indriyāni samannānītāni. Upari pana tiṇṇaṃ maggānaṃ atthāya sevamānā bhajamānā samannānayamānā anupubbena arahattaṃ pāpuṇissantīti ayamettha pāliattho.

Vitaṇḍavādī pana imameva pāḷiṃ gahetvā: lokuttaramaggo na ekacittakkhaṇiko, bahucittakkhaṇiko ti vadati. So vattabbo yadi aññena cittena senāsanaṃ paṭisevati, aññena kalyāṇamitte bhajati, aññena indriyāni samannāneti, aññaṃ maggacittanti sandhāya tvaṃ na ekacittakkhaṇiko maggo, bahucittakkhaṇiko'ti vadasi, evaṃ sante senāsanaṃ sevamāno nīlobhāsaṃ pabbataṃ passati, vanaṃ passati, migapakkhīnaṃ saddaṃ suṇāti, pupphaphalānaṃ gandhaṃ ghāyati, pānīyaṃ pivanto rasaṃ sāyati, nisīdanto nipajjanto phassaṃ phusati. Evaṃ te pañcaviññāṇasamaṅgīpi lokuttaradhammasamaṅgīyeva bhavissati. Sace panetaṃ sampaṭicchasi, satthārā saddhiṃ paṭivirujjhasi. Satthārā hi pañcaviññāṇakāyā ekantaṃ abyākatāva vuttā, taṃsamaṅgissa kusalākusalaṃ paṭikkhittaṃ, lokuttaramaggo ca ekantakusalo. Tasmā pajahetaṃ vāda''nti pañňapetabbo. Sace pañňattiṃ na upagacchati, gaccha pātova vihāraṃ pavisitvā yāguṃ pivāhī ti uyyojetabbo.

 $<sup>^{20}</sup>$  M-a II 363, 404, A-a V 85: So suttam āharā ti vattabbo.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> A II 157: Idha, āvuso, bhikkhu samathapubbangamam vipassanam bhāveti. Tassa samathapubbangamam vipassanam bhāvayato maggo sañjāyati. So taṃ maggam āsevati bhāveti bahulīkaroti. Tassa taṃ maggam āsevato bhāvayato bahulīkaroto saṃyojanāni pahīyanti, anusayā byantīhonti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> A-a III 142: samathapubbangamanti samatham pubbangamam purecārikam katvā. Maggo sañjāyatīti paṭhamo lokuttaramaggo nibbattati. So tam magganti ekacittakkhanikamaggassa āsevanādīni nāma natthi, dutiyamaggādayo pana uppādento tameva āsevati bhāveti bahulīkarotīti vuccati.

This teaching of the commentary leaves no room for the first path-attainer to carry out the Buddha's instruction to act with diligence (appamādena karanīyaṃ) for the simple reason that before he could do anything else the fruit is, as it were, on him rendering thereby the words of the Buddha superfluous. It seeks to set at naught, too, the other teaching of the Buddha: "he who practises for the realisation of the fruit (phalasacchikiriyāya patipanna)." The Buddha says that there are these nine persons: "The Consummate One, and he who practises for (the realisation of that) Consummation; the Non-Returner, and he who practises for the realisation of the fruit of Non-Return; the Once-Returner, and he who practises for the realisation of the fruit of Once-Return; the Stream-Entrant, and he who practises for the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance; and the commoner.<sup>23</sup>" Of these the last is the commoner who is outside the plane of the Noble Ones. The rest are the Noble Ones (ariya) who have crossed over from the plane of the commoner to that of the Noble Ones. The first of these eight Noble Ones is the non-learner (asekha), while the remaining seven are learners (sekha). The seven are fruit-attainers (phalalābhi), and the remaining four are path-attainers (maggalābhi). Concerning these four the Buddha says: "These four things, when developed and cultivated, lead to the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance. Which four? Association with good friends, listening to the Dhamma, deep reflection, and practice in accordance with the Dhamma." The next three Suttas state that the four things mentioned above when developed and cultivated lead to the realisation of the fruit of Once-Return, the realisation of the fruit of non-return, and to the realisation of the fruit of the consummate state.24

Not all the commentaries, however, hold the view that the first path cannot be developed. The Alagaddupama Sutta mentions the Consummate One, the Non-Returner,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> A IV 372: Navayime, bhikkhave, puggalā santo saṃvijjamānā lokasmiṃ. Katame nava? Arahā, arahattāya paṭipanno, anāgāmī, anāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno, sakadāgāmī, sakadāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno, sotāpanno, sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno, puthujjano.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> (a) S V 410–11 Cattārome, bhikkhave, dhammā bhāvitā bahulīkatā sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya ... sakadāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya ... anāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya ... arahattaphalasacchikiriyāya samvattanti. Katame cattāro? Sappurisasaṃsevo, saddhammassavanaṃ, yonisomanasikāro, dhammānudhammappaṭipatti.
(b) Paṭis-a III 641 Tattha sappurisasaṃsevoti heṭṭhā vuttappakārānaṃ sappurisānaṃ bhajanaṃ.
Saddhammassavananti tesaṃ sappurisānaṃ santike sīlādipaṭipattidīpakassa saddhammavacanassa savanaṃ.
Yonisomanasikāroti sutānaṃ dhammānam atthūpaparikkhanavasena upāyena manasikāro.

Dhammānudhammapaṭipattīti lokuttaradhamme anugatassa sīlādipaṭipadādhammassa paṭipajjanaṃ.

<sup>(</sup>c) S-a II 589: Sammā vihareyyunti ettha sotāpanno attano adhigataṭṭhānaṃ aññassa kathetvā taṃ sotāpannaṃ karonto sammā viharati nāma. Esa nayo sakadāgāmiādīsu. Sotāpattimaggaṭṭho aññampi sotāpattimaggaṭṭhaṃ karonto sammā viharati nāma. Esa nayo sesamaggaṭṭhesu. Sotāpattimaggatthāya āraddhavipassako attano paguṇaṃ kammaṭṭhānaṃ kathetvā aññampi sotāpattimaggatthāya āraddhavipassakaṃ karonto sammā viharati nāma. Esa nayo sesamaggatthāya āraddhavipassakesu. Idaṃ sandhāyāha sammā vihareyyun-ti.

<sup>(</sup>d) M-a II 151; Aparehi aṭṭhahi kāraṇehi buddhā bhagavanto cārikaṃ caranti – sotāpattimaggaṃ adhigamissantīti vā, sotāpattiphalaṃ ... pe ... arahattaphalaṃ sacchikarissantīti vāti. Ayaṃ aturitacārikā, sā idha adhippetā.

<sup>(</sup>e) M III 255 Sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanne dānaṃ datvā asaṅkheyyā appameyyā dakkhiṇā pāṭikaṅkhitabbā, ko pana vādo sotāpanne. See also Udāna 6: Atha kho bāhiyassa dārucīriyassa rahogatassa paṭisallīnassa evaṃ cetaso parivitakko udapādi: ye kho keci loke arahanto vā arahattamaggaṃ vā samāpannā, ahaṃ tesaṃ aññataro ti.

the Once-Returner, the Stream-Entrant, the dhamma-striver, and the faith-striver. In this Sutta, too, the difference between the Stream-Entrants (the first fruit-attainers) and the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver (the two kinds of first path-attainers) is stated. The former are assured of going through to enlightenment, while the latter are merely stated to be going through to enlightenment. The assurance (*niyata*) comes only with the first fruit-attainment. Further it makes mention of those who are endowed with faith only (*saddhā-matta*) and affection only (*pemamatta*) for the Blessed One. They are assured of rebirth in heaven. The commentary to this Sutta states that these latter "are as it were taken by hand and placed in heaven." It continues to state that "ancient elders speak of such a bhikkhu as a Lesser Stream-Entrant (*cūlasotāpanna*).<sup>25</sup>"

Here we have (1) the lesser stream-entrant who is bound for rebirth in heaven, (2) the first path-attainer who goes through to enlightenment, and (3) the first fruit-attainer who is assured of going through to enlightenment. The last two have reached the plane of the Noble Ones (ariyabhūmi) while the first is still in the plane of the commoner (puthujjanabhūmi). Concerning the dhamma- and Faith-Striver the commentary says: "There the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver-these two who are established in the path of Stream-Entrance (sotāpattimaggattha). As it is said (in the Puggalapaññātti): Which person is a dhamma-striver? The controlling faculty of wisdom of the person practising for the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance is very great (adhimatta); Wisdom-carried (paññāvahi), preceeded by wisdom (paññāpubbaṅgamam), he develops (bhāveti) the noble path (ariyamagga); this person is called dhamma-striver. The person practising for the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance is dhamma-striver: when established in the fruit this person is called won to view (ditthippatta). Which person is faith-striver? The controlling faculty of Faith of the person practising for the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance is very great (adhimatta); Faith-carried (saddhāvahi), preceeded by faith (saddhāpubbangamam), he develops (bhaveti) the noble path (ariyamagga); this person is called faith-striver. The person practising for the realisation of the fruit of Stream entrance is faith-striver; when established in the fruit this person is called faith-freed (saddhāvimutta).<sup>26</sup>"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> M-a II 120: Yesaṃ mayi saddhāmattaṃ pemamattanti iminā yesaṃ añño ariyadhammo natthi, tathāgate pana saddhāmattaṃ pemamattameva hoti. Te vipassakapuggalā adhippetā. Vipassakabhikkhūnañhi evaṃ vipassanaṃ paṭṭhapetvā nisinnānaṃ dasabale ekā saddhā ekaṃ pemaṃ uppajjati. Tāya saddhāya tena pemena hatthe gahetvā sagge ṭhapitā viya honti, niyatagatikā kira ete. Porāṇakattherā pana evarūpaṃ bhikkhuṃ cūlasotāpannoti vadanti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> (a)M I 141: Evam svākkhāto, bhikkhave, mayā dhammo uttāno vivaţo pakāsito chinnapilotiko. Evam svākkhāte, bhikkhave, mayā dhamme uttāne vivaţe pakāsite chinnapilotike ye te bhikkhū arahanto khīnāsavā vusitavanto katakaranīyā ohitabhārā anuppattasadatthā parikkhīnabhavasamyojanā sammadaññā vimuttā, vaṭṭam tesam natthi paññāpanāya. Evam svākkhāto, bhikkhave, mayā dhammo uttāno vivaţo pakāsito chinnapilotiko. Evam svākkhāte, bhikkhave, mayā dhamme uttāne vivaţe pakāsite chinnapilotike yesam bhikkhūnam pañcorambhāgiyāni samyojanāni pahīnāni, sabbe te opapātikā, tattha parinibbāyino, anāvattidhammā tasmā lokā. Evam svākkhāto, bhikkhave, mayā dhammo uttāno vivaţo pakāsito chinnapilotiko. Evam svākkhāte, bhikkhave, mayā dhamme uttāne vivaţe pakāsite chinnapilotike yesam bhikkhūnam tīni samyojanāni pahīnāni, rāgadosamohā tanubhūtā, sabbe te sakadāgāmino, sakideva imam lokam āgantvā dukkhassantam karissanti. Evam svākkhāto, bhikkhave, mayā dhammo uttāno vivato pakāsito chinnapilotiko.

From the foregoing it will be seen that the Abhidhamma treatise, the Puggalapaññatti and the present commentary in quoting from it do not deviate from the sutta teaching that the first noble path (*ariyamagga*) is developed (*bhāveti*), though some of the commentaries do.<sup>27</sup> The dhamma-striver and the faith-striver, who are first path-attainers, develop that path, and practise for the realisation of the fruit of stream-entrance; and when they realise the fruit they are called won to view and faith-freed respectively. There is, therefore a time interval between the first path-attainment and its fruit-attainment.

Perhaps it may be of interest to note here that the words "pursues, develops, and cultivates" (asevati bhaveti bahulikaroti) are also used in connection with meditation (jhāna). Using the simile of the mountain cow, the first portion of which appears above, the Buddha says: "Just as the wise, skilled, and pasture-knowing mountain cow ... so is it when aloof from sense-desires, aloof from evil states of mind, a monk who is wise, skilled, and knowing the soil (for good deeds), attains to, and abides in the first meditation (jhāna) which is with initial and sustained application of thought, joy and ease born of detachment; he pursues, develops, and cultivates that sign (nimitta), fixing it well."

This is repeated in regard to the second, the third, the fourth meditation, and so on up to the sphere of neither perception nor non-perception.<sup>28</sup> According to the Visuddhimagga the duration of the first meditation is also one thought-moment, thus: "But that Absorption is only of a single conscious moment. For there are seven instances in which the normal extent (of the cognitive series) does not apply. They are in the cases of the first

Evaṃ svākkhāte, bhikkhave, mayā dhamme uttāne vivaṭe pakāsite chinnapilotike yesaṃ bhikkhūnaṃ tīṇi saṃyojanāni pahīnāni, sabbe te sotāpannā, avinipātadhammā, niyatā sambodhiparāyanā. Evaṃ svākkhāto, bhikkhave, mayā dhammo uttāno vivaṭo pakāsito chinnapilotiko. Evaṃ svākkhāte, bhikkhave, mayā dhamme uttāne vivaṭe pakāsite chinnapilotike ye te bhikkhū dhammānusārino saddhānusārino sabbe te sambodhiparāyanā. Evaṃ svākkhāto, bhikkhave, mayā dhammo uttāno vivaṭo pakāsito chinnapilotiko. Evaṃ svākkhāte, bhikkhave, mayā dhamme uttāne vivaṭe pakāsite chinnapilotike yesaṃ mayi saddhāmattaṃ pemamattaṃ sabbe te saggaparāyanā ti.

<sup>(</sup>b) M-a II 120: Tattha dhammānusārino saddhānusārinoti ime dve sotāpattimaggaṭṭhā honti. Yathāha — ''katamo ca puggalo dhammānusārī? Yassa puggalassa sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipannassa paññindriyaṃ adhimattaṃ hoti, paññāvāhiṃ paññāpubbaṅgamaṃ ariyamaggaṃ bhāveti. Ayaṃ vuccati puggalo dhammānusārī. Sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno puggalo dhammānusārī, phale ṭhito diṭṭhippatto. Katamo ca puggalo saddhānusārī? Yassa puggalassa sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipannassa saddhindriyaṃ adhimattaṃ hoti, saddhāvāhiṃ saddhāpubbaṅgamaṃ ariyamaggaṃ bhāveti. Ayaṃ vuccati puggalo saddhānusārī. Sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno puggalo saddhānusārī, phale ṭhito saddhāvimutto ti (Pug 15). Cf. D-a III 890.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> M-a I 363-4; 404

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> A IV 419–21: Tathá hi sá, bhikkhave, gávì pabbateyyá paóðitá byattá khettaññú kusalá visame pabbate carituí. Evamevaí kho, bhikkhave, idhekacco bhikkhu paóðito byatto khettaññú kusalo vivicceva kámehi vivicca akusalehi dhammehi savitakkaí savicáraí vivekajaí pìtisukhaí paþhamaí jhánaí upasampajja viharati. So taí nimittaí ásevati bháveti bahulìkaroti svádhiþþhitaí adhiþþháti. Tassa evaí hoti yaínúnáhaí vitakkavicáránaí vúpasamá ajjhattaí sampasádanaí cetaso ekodibhávaí avitakkaí avicáraí samádhijaí pìtisukhaí dutiyaí jhánaí upasampajja vihareyyanti. So dutiyaí jhánaí ... upasampajja viharati. ... nevasaññánásaññáyatanaí upasampajja viharati. So taí nimittaí ásevati bháveti bahulìkaroti svádhiþþhitaí adhiþþháti (taí nimittan ti taí pathamajjhánasaíkhátaí nimittaí—A-a IV 194).

absorption, the mundane kinds of direct knowledge, the four paths, fruition next after the path  $\dots^{29}$ "

From the foregoing it will be seen that, (1) according to one commentary (the Visuddhimagga) the supramundane paths and fruits, as well as the first meditation (*jhāna*) are one thought-moment in duration; (2) according to another<sup>30</sup> the first supramundane path, since it is one thought-moment in duration, cannot be pursued, developed, and cultivated; (3) yet another,<sup>31</sup> by being silent on the subject, does not deny the possibility of pursuing, developing, and cultivating the first mundane meditation (*jhāna*); (4) the suttas always state that the first supramundane path and the mundane meditations (*jhāna*) are pursued, developed, and cultivated, for further progress.

Here it should be noted that the progress of the seven learners is different from that of the commoner who develops meditation. The learner progresses towards enlightenment and does not retrogress at any time; but it takes seven lives, for instance, in the case of the Stream-Entrant to do this in the normal course of events. It is possible, and the Buddha stressed that it is very desirable, to hasten this process. These two kinds of Stream-Entrant, the one who hastens, and the one who does not do so, both of them progress towards enlightenment by pursuing, developing, and cultivating the path. They are called those who practise for the realisation of the fruit. This holds good for each path. The progress of the commoner who is a first meditation-attainer depends on how much he pursues, develops, and cultivates that meditation. When he gains mastery in it he proceeds to develop the second and so on. Unlike the learner who is free to progress, the commoner is hemmed in on every side by threat of retrogression, which he has to stay by constant effort. The commoner undertakes the first essential steps of putting down the hindrances temporarily, but is still unsure of his ground; the learner is on sure ground, and so is able to subdue the hindrances with greater firmness; the Consummate One utterly destroys the five hindrances with the five aggregates of virtue, concentration, wisdom, freedom, and the knowledge and vision of that freedom.

Closely linked to this teaching of the one-thought-moment-path (*ekacittakkhaṇikamagga*) is the other teaching concerning the second attribute of the Dhamma, immediate (*akalika*). This word is interpreted in the Visuddhimagga to mean that the path is immediately followed by its fruit (*samanantaraphalatta*). But there are a number of Suttas which do not allow this interpretation. Once the Venerable Upavana Thera asked the Buddha what was the meaning of the following attributes of the Dhamma: "Visible here and now, immediate (*akalika*), inviting to come and see, leading on, to be experienced

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Vism 138: *Sā ca pana ekacittakkhaṇikāyeva. Sattasu hi ṭhānesu addhānaparicchedo nāma natthi paṭhamappanāyaṃ, lokiyābhiññāsu, catūsu maggesu, maggānantaraphale ...* (The Venerable Ñāṇamoli Thera's translation. He translates *jhāna* with "absorption").

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> A-a III 142 (See note 22 above).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> A-a Sinh. Ed., p. 803.

individually by the wise.<sup>32</sup>" The Buddha in reply said: "Here, Upavana, a monk seeing a form with the eye experiences form, experiences lust for form. And of that lust for forms which is within him, he knows: 'Within me is lust for forms.' Whichever monk seeing a form with the eye experiences forms, and experiences lust for forms, and when there is lust for forms within, knows: 'Within me is lust for forms', even this indeed is the Teaching visible here and now, immediate (*akalika*), inviting to come and see, leading on, to be experienced individually by the wise" This is so with regard to the other sense-bases too. Now the commentary to this Sutta<sup>33</sup> merely refers the reader to the Visuddhimagga for the interpretation of "visible here and now (*sandiṭṭhika*)" and the other attributes of the Dhamma.

And this is what the Visuddhimagga says: "(Not delayed:) it has no delay (lit, takes no time-*kala*) in the matter of giving its own fruit, thus it is 'without delay (*akāla*).' 'Without delay' is the same as 'not delayed (*akālika*).' What is meant is that instead of giving its fruit after creating a delay (using up time), say, five days, seven days, it gives its fruit immediately next to its own occurrence.

"Or alternatively, what is delayed (*kalika*—lit. 'what takes time') is what needs some distant time to be reached before it can give its fruit. What is that? It is the mundane law of profitable (*kamma*). This, however, is undelayed (*na kalika*) because its fruit comes immediately next to it, so it is 'not delayed (*akalika*).'

"This is said in reference to the path.<sup>34</sup>"

Here, in explaining the term "immediate" as applied to the path, the Visuddhimagga does not resort to its usual practice of citing appropriate authority, often a sutta passage, in support of the position it takes up when important questions such as this are examined. But it merely sets forth its own interpretation which does not enjoy the sanction of the sutta just considered, nor of the following.

(1) "The lustful man because of lust thinks thoughts hurtful to himself, thinks thoughts hurtful to others, thinks thoughts hurtful both to himself and others. Lust abandoned, he does not think thoughts hurtful to himself, nor to others, nor to both himself and others; thus these are visible (*akalika*), inviting to come and see, leading on, to be experienced individually by the wise.<sup>35</sup>"

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> S IV 41: Idha pana, upavāṇa, bhikkhu cakkhunā rūpaṃ disvā rūpappaṭisaṃvedī ca hoti rūparāgappaṭisaṃvedī ca. Santañca ajjhattaṃ rūpesu rāgaṃ 'atthi me ajjhattaṃ rūpesu rāgo'ti pajānāti. Yaṃ taṃ, upavāṇa, bhikkhu cakkhunā rūpaṃ disvā rūpappaṭisaṃvedī ca hoti rūparāgappaṭisaṃvedī ca. Santañca ajjhattaṃ rūpesu rāgaṃ 'atthi me ajjhattaṃ rūpesu rāgo'ti pajānāti. Evampi kho, upavāṇa, sandiṭṭhiko dhammo hoti akāliko ehipassiko opaneyyiko paccattaṃ veditabbo viñnūhī ti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> S-a II 368: Sandiṭṭhikotiādīni visuddhimagge vuttatthāneva.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Vism 1, 216: Attano phaladānaṃ sandhāya nāssa kāloti akālo. Akāloyeva akāliko. Na pañcāhasattāhādibhedaṃ kālaṃ khepetvā phalaṃ deti, attano pana pavattisamanantarameva phaladoti vuttaṃ hoti. Atha vā attano phaladāne pakaṭṭho kālo patto assāti kāliko. Ko so? Lokiyo kusaladhammo. Ayaṃ pana samanantaraphalattā na kālikoti akāliko. Idaṃ maggameva sandhāya vuttaṃ. (The Venerable Ñāṇamoli Thera's translation, The Path of Purification, p. 234.)

(2) "Should there be any cankers distressing and painful that rise by reason of bodily activity, to him who abstains from bodily activity, the cankers which are thus with distress and pain exist not.

"He does not do any new action. Repeatedly contacting the old action, he wears it out visible here and now, immediate (*akalika*), inviting to come and see, leading on to be experienced individually by the wise." So also with regard to verbal and mental activity.

These two Sutta passages too teach the immediacy of each of these living experiences; it does not take time to know that the defilements are abandoned when they are

"Tena hi, brāhmaṇa, taññevettha paṭipucchissāmi. Yathā te khameyya tathā naṃ byākareyyāsi. Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, brāhmaṇa, santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ rāgaṃ 'atthi me ajjhattaṃ rāgo'ti pajānāsi, asantaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ rāgaṃ 'natthi me ajjhattaṃ rāgo'ti pajānāsī''ti? "Evaṃ, bho''. "Yaṃ kho tvaṃ, brāhmaṇa, santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ rāgaṃ 'atthi me ajjhattaṃ rāgo'ti pajānāsi – evaṃpi kho, brāhmaṇa, sandiṭṭhiko dhammo hoti...pe....

"Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, brāhmaṇa, santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ dosaṃ...pe... santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ mohaṃ...pe... santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ kāyasandosaṃ...pe... santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ manosandosaṃ 'atthi me ajjhattaṃ manosandoso'ti pajānāsi, asantaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ manosandosaṃ 'natthi me ajjhattaṃ manosandoso'ti pajānāsī'ti? "Evaṃ, bho". "Yaṃ kho tvaṃ, brāhmaṇa, santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ manosandosaṃ 'atthi me ajjhattaṃ manosandoso'ti pajānāsi, asantaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ manosandosaṃ 'natthi me ajjhattaṃ manosandoso'ti pajānāsi — evaṃ kho, brāhmaṇa, sandiṭṭhiko dhammo hoti akāliko ehipassiko opaneyyiko paccattaṃ veditabbo viññūhī''ti.

(d) A 11 58-59: Ekamantam nisinno kho jānussoni brāhmano bhagavantam etadavoca sanditthikam nibbānam sandiṭṭhikam nibbāna'nti, bho gotama, vuccati. Kittāvatā nu kho, bho gotama, sandiṭṭhikam nibbānam hoti akālikam ehipassikam opaneyyikam paccattam veditabbam viññūhī ti? Ratto kho, brāhmana, rāgena abhibhūto pariyādinnacitto attabyābādhāyapi ceteti, parabyābādhāyapi ceteti, ubhayabyābādhāyapi ceteti, cetasikampi dukkham domanassam paţisamvedeti. Rāge pahīne nevattabyābādhāyapi ceteti, na parabyābādhāyapi ceteti, na ubhayabyābādhāyapi ceteti, na cetasikampi dukkham domanassam patisamvedeti. Evampi kho, brāhmana, sandiṭṭhikaṃ nibbānaṃ hoti. Duṭṭho kho, ... mūḷho kho, ... domanassaṃ paṭisaṃvedeti. Evampi kho, brāhmana, sandiṭṭhikam nibbānam hoti. Yato kho ayam, brāhmana, anavasesam rāgakkhayam paṭisamvedeti, anavasesam dosakkhayam patisamvedeti, anavasesam mohakkhayam patisamvedeti; evam kho, brāhmana, sandiṭṭhikam nibbānam hoti akālikam ehipassikam opaneyyikam paccattam veditabbam viññūhī''ti. (e) A III 356-57: Ekamantam nisinno kho moliyasīvako paribbājako bhagavantam etadavoca sandiṭṭhiko dhammo, sanditthiko dhammo'ti, bhante, vuccati. Kittāvatā nu kho, bhante, sanditthiko dhammo hoti akāliko ehipassiko opaneyyiko paccattam veditabbo viññūhī ti? Tena hi, sīvaka, taññevettha paṭipucchāmi. Yathā te khameyya tathā naṃ byākareyyāsi. Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, sīvaka, santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ lobhaṃ 'atthi me ajjhattaṃ lobho'ti pajānāsi, asantam vā ajjhattam lobham 'natthi me ajjhattam lobho'ti pajānāsī''ti? "Evam, bhante". Yam kho tvam, sīvaka, santam vā ajjhattam lobham 'atthi me ajjhattam lobho'ti pajānāsi, asantam vā ajjhattam lobham 'natthi me ajjhattam lobho'ti pajānāsi – evampi kho, sīvaka, sandiṭṭhiko dhammo hoti...pe.... Tam kim maññasi, sīvaka, santam vā ajjhattam dosam...pe... santam vā ajjhattam moham...pe... santam vā ajjhattam

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> (a) S IV 339: Yam ratto rāgādhikaraṇaṃ attabyābādhāyapi ceteti, parabyābādhāyapi ceteti, ubhayabyābādhāyapi ceteti. Rāge pahīne nevattabyābādhāya ceteti, na parabyābādhāya ceteti, na ubhayabyābādhāya ceteti. Sandiṭṭhikā nijjarā akālikā ehipassikā opaneyyikā paccattaṃ veditabbā viññūhi. Yaṃ duṭṭho ... Yaṃ mūḷho ... veditabbā viññūhi.

<sup>(</sup>b) A II 197-98: Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, vappa, ye kāyasamārambhapaccayā uppajjanti āsavā vighātapariļāhā, kāyasamārambhā paṭiviratassa evaṃsa te āsavā vighātapariļāhā na honti. So navañca kammaṃ na karoti, purāṇañca kammaṃ phussa phussa byantīkaroti, sandiṭṭhikā nijjarā akālikā ehipassikā opaneyyikā paccattaṃ veditabbā viññūhi. Passasi no tvaṃ, vappa, taṃ ṭhānaṃ yatonidānaṃ purisaṃ dukkhavedaniyā āsavā assaveyyuṃ abhisamparāyanti? No hetaṃ, bhante'.

<sup>(</sup>c) A III 357-58: Atha kho aññataro brāhmaṇo yena bhagavā tenupasaṅkami; upasaṅkamitvā bhagavatā saddhiṃ sammodi. Sammodanīyaṃ kathaṃ sāraṇīyaṃ vītisāretvā ekamantaṃ nisīdi. Ekamantaṃ nisinno kho so brāhmaṇo bhagavantaṃ etadavoca — '''sandiṭṭhiko dhammo, sandiṭṭhiko dhammo'ti, bho gotama, vuccati. Kittāvatā nu kho, bho gotama, sandiṭṭhiko dhammo hoti akāliko ehipassiko opaneyyiko paccattaṃ veditabbo viññūhī''ti?

abandoned; they are known at once. Similarly, if the path (*magga*) is attained, that attainment is known without any delay (*akalika*). If the fruit (*phala*) is attained, that also is known without any delay (*akalika*).

The following passage contrasts that which is subject to time with that which is immediate (*akalika*): "Then Māra, the Evil One, created the form of a brahmin with a great topknot, wearing a cheetah skin (consisting of one whole skin, with claws and hair, and split in the middle), frail, crooked as a rafter, breathing heavily, and gripping a walking-stick made of fig-wood, approached those monks. Having approached, he said this: 'Sirs, young, with very, very black hair, and with auspicious youth, you have gone forth, not having yet enjoyed in youth sensual pleasures to the full. Enjoy, sirs, the pleasures that are human. Do not forsake the visible here and now, and pursue things subject to time.' 'We have not, brahmin, pursuing things subject to time, forsaken the visible here and now. Things subject to time (*kalika*), the Blessed One has said, are sense-desires, and abound in ill, abound in despair; the danger herein is more. This Dhamma is visible here and now, immediate (*akalika*), inviting to come and see, leading on, to be experienced individually by the wise,' replied the monks.<sup>36</sup>"

Things subject to time take time to bear fruit; the Dhamma bears fruit immediately in that when one abandons evil, he knows that he has done so; the wearing out of the old evil kamma and doing no new ones is called visible here and now, immediate (*akalika*), and so forth.

Further, the following Sutta, which teaches how the path-attainer becomes fruit-attainer, does not support the view that the path is immediately followed by its fruit. According to this Sutta<sup>37</sup> the two persons established in the path of Stream-Entrance, that is to say, the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver, are incapable of passing away without realising the fruit of Stream-Entrance. This does not mean that the fruit immediately follows the path. Had it been so this would have been a most appropriate occasion for the Buddha to have said it; further, considered in the light of this Sutta, death would be the proximate

lobhadhammaṃ...pe... santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ dosadhammaṃ...pe... santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ mohadhammaṃ 'atthi me ajjhattaṃ mohadhammo'ti pajānāsi, asantaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ mohadhammaṃ 'natthi me ajjhattaṃ mohadhammo'ti pajānāsī''ti? ''Evaṃ, bhante''. ''Yaṃ kho tvaṃ, sīvaka, santaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ mohadhammaṃ 'atthi me ajjhattaṃ mohadhammo'ti pajānāsi, asantaṃ vā ajjhattaṃ mohadhammaṃ 'natthi me ajjhattaṃ mohadhammo'ti pajānāsi evaṃ kho, sīvaka, sandiṭṭhiko dhammo hoti akāliko ehipassiko opaneyyiko paccattaṃ veditabbo viñnūhī''ti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> S I 117: Atha kho māro pāpimā brāhmaṇavaṇṇaṃ abhinimminitvā mahantena jaṭaṇḍuvena ajinakkhipanivattho jiṇṇo gopānasivanko ghurughurupassāsī udumbaradaṇḍaṃ gahetvā yena te bhikkhū tenupasankami; upasankamitvā te bhikkhū etadavoca — ''daharā bhavanto pabbajitā susū kāļakesā bhadrena yobbanena samannāgatā paṭhamena vayasā anikkīļitāvino kāmesu. Bhuñjantu bhavanto mānusake kāme. Mā sandiṭṭhikaṃ hitvā kālikaṃ anudhāvitthā''ti. ''Na kho mayaṃ, brāhmaṇa, sandiṭṭhikaṃ hitvā kālikaṃ anudhāvāma. Kālikañca kho mayaṃ, brāhmaṇa, hitvā sandiṭṭhikaṃ anudhāvāma. Kālikā hi, brāhmaṇa, kāmā vuttā bhagavatā bahudukkhā bahupāyāsā, ādīnavo ettha bhiyyo. Sandiṭṭhiko ayaṃ dhammo akāliko ehipassiko opaneyyiko paccattaṃ veditabbo viññūhī''ti. Evaṃ vutte, māro pāpimā sīsaṃ okampetvā jivhaṃ nillāletvā tivisākhaṃ nalāṭe nalāṭikaṃ vuṭṭhāpetvā daṇḍamolubbha pakkāmi.
<sup>37</sup> S III 225.

cause of immediate fruit-attainment. But we know of numbers of Stream-Entrants (*sotāpanna*) who have lived on for sometime after attaining the fruit of Stream-Entrance, notable among whom is the Venerable Ānanda Thera.

Now this is what the commentary to this Sutta says, "With this arisen path there is no danger to the fruit. Hence it is said: 'When this person is working for the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance, and it happens to be the time for the burning up of the aeon, the aeon does not burn up so long as this person does not realise the fruit of Stream-Entrance. He is called holder up of the aeon.<sup>38</sup>" Here the commentary has quoted from the Puggalapaññatti.

The above shows that there is more of a gap in time between the occurrence of the path and that of the fruit, rather than an immediate occurrence of the fruit following the path. It is to reduce this gap, and so to hasten fruit-attainment that the Buddha exhorts the learners (*sekha*), included among whom are the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver being the two kinds of first path-attainers, and who are likened to a baby calf just born, to act with diligence (*appamadena karaniyam*). Failure to do so would mean delaying till death to reach the fruit. But the Buddha does not favour this delay.

The Buddha illustrated the magnitude of the Stream-Entrant's achievement with a simile. He says that just as the bit of soil he had placed on his nail is very small in comparison with the great earth, so the ill (*dukkha*) that the Stream-Entrant has destroyed is as vast as the earth; and what remains to be endured during the maximum of seven births left to him is comparable to the little bit of soil on the Buddha's nail.<sup>39</sup> He has also extolled this achievement in the Dhammapada: "Better than sole kingship of the earth, better than going to heaven, better than supreme rulership of all the worlds, is the fruit of Stream-Entrance.<sup>40</sup>" Yet, as we have already seen, he exhorts all the Noble Ones, except the Consummate One, to act with diligence and to hasten the attainment of realising Nibbāna. They are freed from birth in the four evil states of existence too. The following statement of the Buddha perhaps partly indicates the reason for his insistence on diligence. He says: "Monks, just as a little bit of faeces is foul-smelling, even so do I not praise existence, not

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> S-a II 346: Abhabbo ca tāva kālam kātunti iminā uppanne magge phalassa anantarāyatam dīpeti. Uppannasmiñhi magge phalassa antarāyakaraṇam nāma natthi. Tenevāha ayañca puggalo sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno assa, kappassa ca uḍḍayhanavelā assa, neva tāva kappo uḍḍayheyya, yāvāyam puggalo na sotāpattiphalam sacchikaroti, ayam vuccati puggalo ṭhitakappī ti (Pug 13)
<sup>39</sup> S II 133: Etadeva, bhante, bahutaram, yadidam mahāpathavī. Appamattako bhagavatā paritto nakhasikhāyam paṃsu āropito. Neva satimam kalam upeti na sahassimam kalam upeti na satasahassimam kalam upeti mahāpathavim upanidhāya bhagavatā paritto nakhasikhāyam paṃsu āropito ti. Evameva kho, bhikkhave, ariyasāvakassa diṭṭhisampannassa puggalassa abhisametāvino etadeva bahutaram dukkham yadidam parikkhīṇam pariyādiṇṇam; appamattakam avasiṭṭham. Neva satimam kalam upeti na sahassimam kalam upeti na satasahassimam kalam upeti purimam dukkhakhandham parikkhīṇam pariyādiṇṇam upanidhāya yadidam sattakkhattumparamatā. Evam mahatthiyo kho, bhikkhave, dhammābhisamayo; evam mahatthiyo dhammacakkhupatilābho ti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Dhp 178: Pathavyā ekarajjena saggassa gamanena vā Sabbalokadhipaccena sotāpattiphalam varam.

even for so brief a time as is needed for a finger-snap. 41" Again he says: "Cross over this place of torment. 42"

It is, therefore not surprising to find these last words of the Buddha recorded in the Mahā-parinibbāna Sutta: "The least of these five hundred monks, Ānanda, is a Stream-Entrant, not liable to be born in evil states of existence, and is assured of attaining enlightenment." Then the Blessed One addressed the monks: "Transient are component things; finish with diligence. Since this instruction does not apply to the Consummate One, and since there were no newly born Stream-Entrant path-attainers, viz., the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver, present, these last words were meant for the six learners beginning with the Stream-Entrant (sotāpanna). When the teaching of diligence (appamada) is so important to those who are bound for enlightenment and are on safe ground, how much more should it be to those still struggling in the plane of the commoner (puthujjanabhūmi) yearning for the deathless (amata)? And here one is reminded of the Dhammapada stanza: 44

"The path to deathlessness is diligence,

And what to death leads on is negligence.

The men who diligent are never die;

The negligent ones are, as it were, dead. 45"

That the path-attainer engages himself in many activities before he attains to the corresponding fruit is stated in many Suttas. The following are some instances: (1) The Buddha says that monks desirous of material gain praise one another in the presence of laymen clad in white thus: "Such and such a monk is freed in both ways; such and such a monk is wisdom-freed; such and such a monk is a body-witness; such and such a monk won to view; such and such a monk is faith-freed; such and such a monk is a dhamma-striver; and such and such a monk is a faith-striver." (2) The Buddha asks the Venerable Bhaddali Thera what he thinks would be the attitude of a monk freed in both ways if the Buddha told him: "Come here, monk, be a plank on the mud for me to pass over;" what would he do he asks: "Would he make a plank of himself, or would he writhe his body in another direction,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> A I 34: Seyyathā pi, bhikkhave, appamattakopi gūtho duggandho hoti; evamevaṃ kho ahaṃ, bhikkhave, appamattakampi bhavaṃ na vaṇṇemi, antamaso accharāsaṅghātamattampi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Sn 706: Tareyya narakam imam.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> D II 155–56: Imesañhi, ānanda, pañcannaṃ bhikkhusatānaṃ yo pacchimako bhikkhu, so sotāpanno avinipātadhammo niyato sambodhiparāyaṇo ti. Atha kho bhagavā bhikkhū āmantesi: handa dāni, bhikkhave, āmantayāmi vo, vayadhammā saṅkhārā appamādena sampādethā ti. Ayaṃ tathāgatassa pacchimā vācā.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Dhp 21: Appamādo amatapadam, pamādo maccuno padam appamatto no mīyanti ye pamattā yathā matā.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Soma Thera's Translation.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> A I 73–74: Katamā ca, bhikkhave, āmisagaru parisā no saddhammagaru? Idha, bhikkhave, yassaṃ parisāyaṃ bhikkhū gihīnaṃ odātavasanānaṃ sammukhā aññamaññassa vaṇṇaṃ bhāsanti – 'asuko bhikkhu ubhatobhāgavimutto, asuko paññāvimutto, asuko kāyasakkhī, asuko diṭṭhippatto, asuko saddhāvimutto, asuko dhammānusārī, asuko saddhānusārī, asuko sīlavā kalyānadhammo, asuko dussīlo pāpadhammoti.

or would he say, 'No?'" To which the Venerable Bhaddali Thera replies, "No, indeed, Venerable sir." Then the Buddha puts the same question to him regarding the wisdom-freed, the body-witness, him who has won to view, the faith-freed, the dhamma-striver, and the faith-striver. The reply of the Venerable Bhaddali Thera again in each case is "No, indeed, venerable sir.<sup>47</sup>" (3) The Non-Returner Ugga, the householder of Hatthigama, tells a certain monk that when he invites the Sangha to a meal devas come to him and tell him: "Such and such a monk is freed in both ways; such and such and such a monk is wisdom-freed; such and such a monk is a body-witness; such and such a monk is won to view; such and such a monk is faith-freed; such and such a monk is a dhamma-striver; such and such a monk is a faith-striver; such and such a monk is a virtuous one, of good conduct; such and such a monk is a bad character, of evil habits" But he says that when he serves alms to the Sangha no thoughts, such as: "Let me give to him a little, to him plenty", arise in him. He further says: "But, venerable sir, I give with an equal mind.<sup>48</sup>"

Here the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver who are attainers of the first path, along with the others, are either pointed out, or are asked to do something, or are partaking of a meal; and to do any one of these things necessarily takes time, more than one thought-moment. They are appropriately called those who work. The most important work they do is for the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance. Similarly the other path-attainers work for the realisation of their respective fruits as stated earlier. It also occurs in the following Sutta: "Just as, Paharada, the great ocean is the abode of huge beings ... so is this doctrine and discipline the abode of great beings. They are: (1) the Stream-Entrant, (2) he who practises for the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance, (3) the Once-Returner, (4) he who practises for the realisation of the fruit of Non-Return, (5) the Non-Returner, (6) he who practises for (the realisation of) the consummate state." More light is shed on the subject by the following Sutta and its commentary.<sup>49</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> M I 439–40: Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, bhaddāli, idhassa bhikkhu ubhatobhāgavimutto, tamahaṃ evaṃ vadeyyaṃ – 'ehi me tvaṃ, bhikkhu, paṅke saṅkamo hohī ti, api nu kho so saṅkameyya vā aññena vā kāyaṃ sannāmeyya, no ti vā vadeyyā ti? No hetaṃ, bhante. Taṃ kiṃ maññasi, bhaddāli, idhassa bhikkhu paññāvimutto ... kāyasakkhi ... diṭṭhippatto ... saddhāvimutto ... dhammānusārī ... saddhānusārī, tamahaṃ evaṃ vadeyyaṃ: ehi me tvaṃ, bhikkhu, paṅke saṅkamo hohī'ti, api nu kho so saṅkameyya vā aññena vā kāyaṃ sannāmeyya, no ti vā vadeyyā ti? No hetaṃ, bhante.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> A IV 215: Anacchariyam kho pana, bhante, sanghe nimantite devatā upasankamitvā ārocenti — 'asuko, gahapati, bhikkhu ubhatobhāgavimutto asuko paññāvimutto asuko kāyasakkhī asuko diṭṭhippatto asuko saddhāvimutto asuko dhammānusārī asuko saddhānusārī asuko sīlavā kalyāṇadhammo asuko dussīlo pāpadhammo'ti. Sanghaṃ kho panāhaṃ, bhante, parivisanto nābhijānāmi evaṃ cittaṃ uppādento — 'imassa vā thokaṃ demi imassa vā bahuka'nti. Atha khvāhaṃ, bhante, samacittova demi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> (a) A IV 203–4: Seyyathā pi, pahārāda, mahāsamuddo mahataṃ bhūtānaṃ āvāso; tatrime bhūtā – timi timingalo timirapingalo asurā nāgā gandhabbā; santi mahāsamudde yojanasatikāpi attabhāvā, dviyojanasatikāpi attabhāvā, tiyojanasatikāpi attabhāvā, catuyojanasatikāpi attabhāvā, pañcayojanasatikāpi attabhāvā; evamevaṃ kho, pahārāda, ayaṃ dhammavinayo mahataṃ bhūtānaṃ āvāso; tatrime bhūtā sotāpanno sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno, sakadāgāmī sakadāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno, anāgāmī anāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno, arahā arahattāya paṭipanno.

"Monks, those monks, recently gone forth, new comers to this doctrine and discipline, should be spurred on to, advised, and made firm, in the development of the four foundations of mindfulness. Which four and how? (Thus) Come brothers, (a) ardent, fully aware, singleminded (<code>ekodi-bhūta</code>), with thought quite purified (<code>vippasannacitta</code>), concentrated (samahita) and unified of mind (<code>ekagga-citta</code>), dwell practising body-contemplation on the body for (the purpose of attaining to) the knowledge of the body as it really is; (b) ardent ... dwell practising feeling-contemplation on feelings for (the purpose of attaining to) the knowledge of the mind as it really is; (d) ardent ... dwell practising phenomenon-contemplation on phenomena for (the purpose of attaining to) the knowledge of phenomena as they really are.

"Monks, those who are learners (*sekha*), who with non-negligent minds, and aspiring for the peerless freedom from all bonds, they too, (a) ardent, fully aware, single-minded, with thought quite purified, concentrated, and unified of mind, dwell practising body-contemplation on the body for (the purpose of attaining to) full knowledge of the body; (b) ardent, fully aware, single-minded, with thought quite purified, concentrated, and unified of mind, dwell practising feeling-contemplation on feelings for (the purpose of attaining to) full knowledge of feelings; (c) ardent fully aware, single-minded, with thought quite purified, concentrated, and unified of mind, dwell practising mind-contemplation on the mind for (the purpose of attaining to) full knowledge of the mind; (d) ardent, fully aware, single-minded, with thought quite purified, concentrated, and unified of mind, dwell practising phenomenon-contemplation on phenomena for (the purpose of attaining to) full knowledge of phenomena.

"Monks, those who are Consummate Ones, who have destroyed the cankers, perfected, who have done what had to be done, who have laid down the burden, who have won to the goal, who have destroyed the fetters of the states of existence, and are freed by uttermost knowledge, they too, (a) ardent, fully aware, single-minded, with thought quite purified, concentrated and unified of mind, dwell practising body-contemplation on the body detached from the world as regards the body; (b) ardent ... dwell practising feeling-contemplation on feelings detached from the world as regards feelings; (c) ardent ... dwell practising mind-contemplation on the mind detached from the world as regards the mind; (d) ardent ... dwell practising phenomenon-contemplation on phenomena detached from the world as regards phenomena.<sup>50</sup>"

<sup>(</sup>b) A I 44 Ekadhammo, bhikkhave, bhāvito bahulīkato sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya saṃvattati... sakadāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya saṃvattati... anāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya saṃvattati... arahattaphalasacchikiriyāya samvattati. Katamo ekadhammo? Kāyagatāsati.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> S V 144–45: Ye te, bhikkhave, bhikkhū navā acirapabbajitā adhunāgatā imam dhammavinayam, te vo, bhikkhave, bhikkhū catunnam satipaṭṭhānānam bhāvanāya samādapetabbā nivesetabbā patiṭṭhāpetabbā. Katamesam catunnam? Etha tumhe, āvuso, kāye kāyānupassino viharatha ātāpino sampajānā ekodibhūtā vippasannacittā samāhitā ekaggacittā, kāyassa yathābhūtam ñāṇāya; vedanāsu vedanānupassino viharatha ... citte cittānupassino viharatha ... dhammesu dhammānupassino viharatha ātāpino sampajānā ekodibhūtā

It is well known that only path-attainers are capable of becoming fruit-attainers; and that the seven learners (*sekha*) are the four path-attainers and the first three fruit-attainers. According to the Sutta cited above all learners too develop the four foundations of mindfulness "for (the purpose of attaining to) full knowledge" of body, feelings mind, and phenomena respectively. And the development of each foundation of mindfulness is preceded by the following qualification as well: "ardent, fully aware, single-minded, with thought quite purified, concentrated and unified of mind." All this activity, the development of the four foundations of mindfulness together with the qualification that has to precede this development, it will be noted, necessarily takes time, its duration varying according to the capacity of the individual learner (*sekha*) concerned. This being so, path-attainment cannot be immediately followed by fruit-attainment.

The relationship between the path-attainer and the fruit-attainer is stated here: the fruit-attainer and he who realises the fruit. In other words: the Stream-Entrant who is the fruit-attainer on the one hand, and the path-attainer, who is either the dhamma-striver or the faith-striver, practising for the realisation of that fruit on the other; the Once-Returner who is fruit-attainer on the one hand, and the path-attainer practising for the realisation of that fruit on the other; the Non-Returner who is the fruit-attainer on the one hand, and the path-attainer practising for the realisation of that fruit on the other; and the Consummate One who is the fruit-attainer on the one hand, and the path-attainer practising for the realisation of that fruit on the other. Therefore it is clear hat path-attainment is not immediately followed by fruit-attainment, except possibly where imminent death of the newly arisen Path-Attainer intervenes, when, of course, fruit-attainment taking precedence over death, according to the Sutta quoted earlier would immediately follow path-attainment. This is the only instance one can think of where the path is immediately followed by its fruit, fruit-attainment precipitated by impending death.

From the foregoing we have seen:

- (1) that the dhamma-striver and the faith-striver are those who, transcending the plane of the commoner, have entered the right path, entered the plane of the worthy;
- (2) that they are endowed with the five controlling faculties which only the Noble Ones possess, unshared by the commoner;
- (3) that they are endowed with the path of Stream-Entrance (sotāpattimaggasamangino);
  - (4) that they are established in the path of Stream-Entrance (sotāpattimaggattha);

vippasannacittā samāhitā ekaggacittā, dhammānam yathābhūtam ñāṇāya.

Yepi te, bhikkhave, bhikkhū sekhā appattamānasā anuttaraṃ yogakkhemaṃ patthayamānā viharanti, tepi kāye kāyānupassino viharanti ātāpino sampajānā ekodibhūtā vippasannacittā samāhitā ekaggacittā, kāyassa pariññāya; ...

Yepi te, bhikkhave, bhikkhū arahanto khīṇāsavā vusitavanto katakaraṇīyā ohitabhārā anuppattasadatthā parikkhīṇabhavasaṃyojanā sammadaññā vimuttā, tepi kāye kāyānupassino viharanti ātāpino sampajānā ekodibhūtā vippasannacittā samāhitā ekaggacittā, kāyena visaṃyuttā; ...

- (5) that they are incapable of passing away without realising the fruit of Stream-Entrance;
- (6) that there are four persons who are practising the same four things each for the realisation of the four fruits. These four persons are identified in the Puggalapaññātti (p.73) as the four path-attainers thus (see Human Types103):

"Here, who are the four persons who are path-endowed, and who the four persons who are fruit-endowed?

The Stream-Entrant, and he who practises for the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance; the Once-Returner, and he who practises for the realisation of the fruit of Once-Return; the Non-Returner, and he who practises for the realisation of the fruit of Non-Return; and the Consummate One, and he who practises for the realisation of the fruit of the consummate state. These four persons are path-endowed, and these four are fruit-endowed.<sup>51</sup>"

It will be noted that these are the four pairs of persons, the eight kinds of individuals (*cattari purisayugani attha purisa puggala*) often mentioned in the Suttas.

Path- and fruit-attainment is a two-way process, i.e., an abandonment and a development, as in the case of meditation (*jhāna*) attainment. What was stated so far is the way of development. One aspect of the way of abandonment is stated in the following passage from the Puggalapaññātti (pp. 17–18) (see *Human Types* 26–27).

The person practising for the abandonment of the three fetters is the person practising for the realisation of the fruit of Stream-Entrance; the person whose fetters are abandoned is called Stream-Entrant.<sup>52</sup>

The person practising for the decrease of lust and ill-will is the person practising for the realisation of the fruit of Once-Return; the person whose lust and ill-will have been decreased is called Once-Returner.

The person practising for the complete abandonment of lust for rebirth in the form and formless worlds, of pride, agitation, and ignorance is the person practising for the realisation of the fruit of the consummate state; the person whose lust for rebirth in the form and formless worlds, pride, agitation, and ignorance are abandoned completely is called the Consummate One.

Another fact that is clearly stated here and which is in conformity with the Suttas cited earlier is that it is the fruit-attainer who abandons the fetters. The path-attainer works for that end with the attainment of which he becomes fruit-attainer. Thus the path-attainer has much to do which occupies much more than one thought-moment of his time, for it

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Pug 73: Tattha katame cattāro maggasamaṅgino, cattāro phalasamaṅgino puggalā? Sotāpanno, sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno; sakadāgāmī, sakadāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno; anāgāmī, anāgāmiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno; arahā, arahattaphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno; ime cattāro maggasamaṅgino, ime cattāro phalasamaṅgino puggalā.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Pug 17f.: Katamo ca puggalo sotāpanno sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno? Tiṇṇaṃ saṃyojanānaṃ pahānāya paṭipanno puggalo sotāpattiphalasacchikiriyāya paṭipanno. Yassa puggalassa tīṇi saṃyojanāni pahīnāni – ayaṃ vuccati puggalo sotāpanno.

takes all the path-attainer's time to mature into fruit-attainer before he passes away from that life.

The facts so far considered leave no room for the view that the path is immediately followed by its fruit, since the four path-attainers have to work with diligence just as much as the three fruit-attainers. The Buddha has declared that the seven learners are not exempt from this requirement. Only the Consummate One is not bound by it. The path-attainer does not automatically attain to the fruit immediately just by virtue of his path-attainment. According to the Suttas one of two things make fruit-attainment possible: (1) diligent work, or (2) the crisis of approaching death; diligent work spread over a period, whether long or short, which will hasten the attainment, or failing that the crisis of impending death which provides the necessary impetus to attainment.

In this matter the Buddha's instructions are clear as set forth in the following Sutta.

"Here, monks, a monk may say thus: 'Face to face with the Blessed One, friend, have I heard, face to face have I received this. This is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya, this is the message of the Teacher.' Monks, the speech of that monk should neither be welcomed nor reviled. Non-welcoming, non-reviling, every word and syllable should be studied, placed beside the Sutta and compared with the Vinaya. When placed beside the Sutta and compared with the Vinaya, should they not fit in with the Sutta, nor accord with the Vinaya, you should come to the conclusion: 'Truly this is not the word of the Blessed One, and has been wrongly grasped by that monk.' Thus, monks, you should reject it. If they fit in with the Sutta and accord with the Vinaya, then you should come to the conclusion: 'Truly this is the word of the Blessed One, and has been rightly grasped by the monk.' Monks, understand this as the first great or principal appeal to authority.

"Again, monks, a monk may say: 'In such and such a residence lives a community of monks with an elder, a leader. Face to face with that community of monks have I heard, face to face have I received it. This is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya, this is the message of the Teacher.' Monks, the speech of that monk should neither be welcomed nor reviled. Non-welcoming, non-reviling, every word and syllable should be studied, placed beside the Sutta and compared with the Vinaya. When placed beside the Sutta and compared with the Vinaya, should they not fit in with the Sutta nor accord with the Vinaya you should come to the conclusion: 'Truly this is not the word of the Blessed One, and has been wrongly grasped by that monk.' Thus, monks, you should reject it. If they fit in with the Sutta and accord with the Vinaya, then you should come to the conclusion: 'Truly this is the word of the Blessed One, and has been rightly grasped by that community of monks.' Monks, understand this as the second great or principal appeal to authority.

"Again, monks, a monk may say: 'In such and such a residence live many elder monks, of great knowledge, who have mastered the tradition (āgama), Dhamma-bearers, Vinaya-bearers, tabulated summary-bearers. Face to face with these elders have I heard, face to face have I received it. This is the Dhamma, this is the Vinaya this is the message of the

Teacher.' Monks, the speech of that monk should neither be welcomed nor reviled. Non-welcoming, non-reviling, every word and syllable should be well studied, placed beside the Sutta and compared with the Vinaya. When placed beside the Sutta and compared with the Vinaya, should they not fit in with the Sutta, nor accord with the Vinaya, you should come to the conclusion: 'Truly this is not the word of the Blessed One, and has been wrongly grasped by those elders.' Thus, monks, you should reject it. If they fit in with the Sutta and accord with the Vinaya, then you should come to the conclusion: 'Truly this is the word of the Blessed One, and has been rightly grasped by those elders.' Monks, understand this as the third great or principal appeal to authority.

"Again, monks, a monk may say: 'In such and such a residence lives a monk, an elder, of great knowledge, who has mastered the tradition, a Dhamma-bearer, a Vinaya bearer, a tabulated summary-bearer. Face to face with this elder have I heard, face to face with him have I received it. This is the Dhamma, this is Vinaya, this is the message of the Teacher.' Monks, the speech of that monk should neither be welcomed nor reviled. Non-welcoming, non-reviling, every word and syllable should be well studied, placed beside the Sutta and compared with the Vinaya. When placed beside the Sutta and compared with the Vinaya, should they not fit in with the Sutta, nor accord with the Vinaya, you should come to the conclusion: 'Truly this is not the word of the Blessed one, and has been wrongly grasped by that elder.' Thus, monks, you should reject it. If they fit in with the Sutta and accord with the Vinaya, then you should come to the conclusion: 'Truly this is the word of the Blessed one and has been rightly grasped by that elder.' Monks, understand this as the fourth great or principal appeal to authority.<sup>53</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> A II 168–70; D II 124–26: Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu evam vadeyya – 'sammukhā metam, āvuso, bhagavato sutam sammukhā paṭiggahitam, ayam dhammo ayam vinayo idam satthusāsana'nti. Tassa, bhikkhave, bhikkhuno bhāsitam neva abhinanditabbam nappaṭikkositabbam. Anabhinanditvā appaṭikkositvā tāni padabyañjanāni sādhukam uggahetvā sutte otāretabbāni, vinaye sandassetabbāni. Tāni ce sutte otāriyamānāni vinaye sandassiyamānāni na ceva sutte otaranti, na ca vinaye sandissanti, niṭṭhamettha gantabbaṃ – 'addhā, idaṃ na ceva tassa bhagavato vacanaṃ; imassa ca bhikkhuno duggahita'nti. Itihetaṃ, bhikkhave, chaḍḍeyyātha. Tāni ce sutte otāriyamānāni vinaye sandassiyamānāni sutte ceva otaranti, vinaye ca sandissanti, nitthamettha gantabbam – 'addhā, idam tassa bhagavato vacanam; imassa ca bhikkhuno suggahita'nti. Idam, bhikkhave, pathamam mahāpadesam dhāreyyātha. Idha pana, bhikkhave, bhikkhu evam vadeyya – 'amukasmim nāma āvāse sangho viharati sathero sapāmokkho. Tassa me sanghassa sammukhā sutam sammukhā paṭiggahitam, ayam dhammo ayam vinayo idam satthusāsana'nti. Tassa, bhikkhave, bhikkhuno bhāsitam neva abhinanditabbam nappaţikkositabbam. Anabhinanditvā appaţikkositvā tāni padabyañjanāni sādhukam uggahetvā sutte otāretabbāni, vinaye sandassetabbāni. Tāni ce sutte otāriyamānāni vinaye sandassiyamānāni na ceva sutte otaranti, na ca vinaye sandissanti, niṭṭhamettha gantabbam – 'addhā, idam na ceva tassa bhagavato vacanam; tassa ca sanghassa duggahita'nti. Itihetam, bhikkhave, chaddeyyātha. Tāni ce sutte otāriyamānāni vinaye sandassiyamānāni sutte ceva otaranti vinaye ca sandissanti, nitthamettha gantabbam – 'addhā, idam tassa bhagavato vacanam; tassa ca sanghassa suggahita'nti. Idam, bhikkhave, dutiyam mahāpadesam dhāreyyātha. Idha pana, bhikkhave, bhikkhu evam vadeyya – 'amukasmim nāma āvāse sambahulā therā bhikkhū viharanti bahussutā āgatāgamā dhammadharā vinayadharā mātikādharā. Tesam me therānam sammukhā sutam sammukhā paṭiggahitam – ayam dhammo ayam vinayo idam satthusāsana'nti. Tassa, bhikkhave, bhikkhuno bhāsitam neva abhinanditabbam...pe... na ca vinaye sandissanti, nitthamettha gantabbam – 'addhā, idam na ceva tassa bhagavato vacanam; tesañca therānam duggahita'nti. Itihetam, bhikkhave, chaḍḍeyyātha. Tāni ce sutte otāriyamānāni...pe... vinaye ca sandissanti, niṭṭhamettha gantabbam — 'addhā, idam tassa bhagavato vacanam; tesañca therānam suggahita'nti. Idam, bhikkhave, tatiyam mahāpadesam dhāreyyātha.

### Nibbāna (What it is not)

It is a widely held view that everything, including nibbāna, is not-self (*anattā*). And if this in fact is so, then nibbāna is reducible to something mundane, something conditioned. But nibbāna is unique. It stands alone and does not share its qualities with anything else. It alone is unconditioned. If it is happiness, it is not of the mundane kind which is felt. Nibbāna's happiness, being the happiness of relief, is not felt.<sup>54</sup> It is supreme happiness.<sup>55</sup> If it is lasting, it is so not in the sense of a self or a soul, but because this attainment, that is to say, the destruction of rebirth<sup>56</sup> and the cessation of ill is irreversible.

What precisely is not-self, why is a thing not-self, and what results when a thing is not-self, are clearly explained by the Buddha in the following sutta passages.

- (1) "Form, monks, is impermanent; what is impermanent, that is ill; what is ill, that is not-self; what is not-self, that is not mine, that am I not, that is not my self.<sup>57</sup>" So also are the other four aggregates. If nibbāna is not-self, then it follows that nibbāna is impermanent, and is therefore subject to ill, just as the five aggregates are.
- (2) "Form, monks, is impermanent, feeling is impermanent, perception is impermanent, formations are impermanent, and consciousness is impermanent. Form, monks, is not-self, feeling is not-self, perception is not-self. All formations are impermanent (sabbe saṅkhārā aniccā), all things are not-self (sabbe dhammā anattā). Here the Buddha views the five aggregates in two ways, namely, as formations (saṅkhārā) which are impermanent, and as things (dhamma) which are not-self. "All" (sabbe) qualifying "formations" and "things" cover the five aggregates only. Thus the Buddha confines not-self (anattā) to the mundane, leaving the unconditioned nibbāna uncontaminated with anything mundane. Arising, decay, and change, which are bound up with not-self, are not found in the unconditioned nibbāna. They are only found in the mundane. This is why "saṅkhāra" is

Idha pana, bhikkhave, bhikkhu evaṃ vadeyya – 'amukasmiṃ nāma āvāse eko thero bhikkhu viharati bahussuto āgatāgamo dhammadharo vinayadharo mātikādharo. Tassa me therassa sammukhā sutaṃ sammukhā paṭiggahitaṃ – ayaṃ dhammo ayaṃ vinayo idaṃ satthusāsana'nti. Tassa, bhikkhave, bhikkhuno bhāsitaṃ neva abhinanditabbaṃ nappaṭikkositabbaṃ. Anabhinanditvā appaṭikkositvā tāni padabyañjanāni sādhukaṃ uggahetvā sutte otāritabbāni, vinaye sandassetabbāni. Tāni ce sutte otāriyamānāni vinaye sandassiyamānāni na ceva sutte otaranti, na ca vinaye sandissanti, niṭṭhamettha gantabbaṃ – 'addhā, idaṃ na ceva tassa bhagavato vacanaṃ; tassa ca therassa duggahita'nti. Itihetaṃ, bhikkhave, chaḍḍeyyātha. Tāni ca sutte otāriyamānāni vinaye sandassiyamānāni sutte ceva otaranti, vinaye ca sandissanti, niṭṭhamettha gantabbaṃ – 'addhā, idaṃ tassa bhagavato vacanaṃ; tassa ca therassa suggahita'nti. Idaṃ, bhikkhave, catutthaṃ mahāpadesaṃ dhāreyyātha. Ime kho, bhikkhave, cattāro mahāpadese dhāreyyāthā ti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> A IV 415: Etad eva kho ettha ávuso sukhaí, yad ettha natthi vedayitaí.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Dhp 204: *Nibbānai paramai sukhanti*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Th 948: Idam vatvā sālavane, samaņo bhāvitindriyo; brāhmaņo parinibbāyī, isi khīṇapunabbhavo ti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> S III 22: Rūpai bhikkhave aniccai, yad aniccai tai dukkhai, yai dukkhai tad anattā, yad anattā tai netai mama nesohamasmi na meso atta tt.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> M I 229: Rūpaṃ, bhikkhave, aniccaṃ, vedanā aniccā, saññā aniccā, saṅkhārā aniccā, viññāṇaṃ aniccaṃ. Rūpaṃ, bhikkhave, anattā, vedanā anattā, saññā anattā, saṅkhārā anattā, viññāṇaṃ anattā. Sabbe saṅkhārā aniccā, sabbe dhammā anattā ti.

substituted with "dhamma" in the Dhammapada, and not for the purpose of giving nibbāna a mundane attribute, namely, not-self. And the Dhammapada states:

"All things are not-self and when one sees this with wisdom, he wearies of ill. This is the path to purity. $^{60}$ "

The commentary in accordance with the abovementioned Sutta passages, and a host of others besides, rightly says: "There all things (*sabbe dhamma*) means the five aggregates only.<sup>61</sup>"

- (3) "Monks, those recluses and brahmins, who consider self in various ways, consider it as the five aggregates of grasping, or any one of them. 62" Here those recluses and brahmins asserted that there was a self in the five aggregates of grasping, or in any one of them, and the Buddha denied it, just there where they asserted it was. A concept without a referent in regard to the mundane was posited by these recluses and brahmins, and the Buddha pointed out that it had no basis in fact, that it is but a mere concept without a referent. It is like a man speaking of flowers that grew in the sky, or of the horns of a hare, and someone should tell him that these are mere concepts; that no flowers grew in the sky, and that hares do not have horns. The Buddha did not go further than deny self (attā) in the mundane sphere.
- (4) "Monks, form is not-self. If form, monks, were the self, form would not tend to disease; and one could say of form: 'Let my form be thus, let it not be thus.' Monks, because form is not-self, therefore form tends to disease; and one could not say of form: 'Let my form be thus, let it not be thus.'" The Sutta goes on to say the same thing with regard to the other four aggregates too.

Now if one claims that nibbāna is not-self (*anattā*), then one also claims that nibbāna tends to disease as much as the five aggregates. This is to drag nibbāna down to the level of the mundane. But nibbāna is the complete transcension of the mundane with its concept of a self and of its denial. The seeing of the mundane as not-self is the path to purity but not purity itself which is the unconditioned (*asaṅkhata*), or the deathless (*amata*), nibbāna, notwithstanding the Visuddhimagga statement: "Empty of self is the deathless state.<sup>63</sup>"

(5) The Buddha explains clearly in the following Sutta what "empty of self" means. Here the  $anatt\bar{a}$  teaching is expressed in a different way, thus: "Monks, because the world is empty of a self, or anything belonging to a self, therefore it is said, 'The world is empty.'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> A I 152: Tīṇimāni, bhikkhave, saṅkhatassa saṅkhatalakkhaṇāni. Katamāni tīṇi? Uppādo paññāyati, vayo paññāyati, ṭhitassa aññathattaṃ paññāyati. Imāni kho, bhikkhave, tīṇi saṅkhatassa saṅkhatalakkhaṇānī ti. Tīṇimāni, bhikkhave, asaṅkhatassa asaṅkhatalakkhaṇāni. Katamāni tīṇi? Na uppādo paññāyati, na vayo paññāyati, na ṭhitassa aññathattaṃ paññāyati. Imāni kho, bhikkhave, tīṇi asaṅkhatassa asaṅkhatalakkhaṇānī ti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Dhp 178: Sabbe dhammā anattā ti yadā paññāya passati, atha nibbindati dukkhe esa maggo visuddhiyā.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Dhp-a III 406: Tattha sabbe dhammāti pañcakkhandhā eva adhippetā.

 $<sup>^{62}</sup>$  S III 46: Ye hi keci, bhikkhave, samaṇā vā brāhmaṇā vā anekavihitaṃ attānaṃ samanupassamānā samanupassanti, sabbete pañcupādānakkhandhe samanupassanti, etesaṃ vā aññataraṃ.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Vism II 513: Dhuvasubhasukhattasuññam, purimadvayam-attasuññam-amatapadam; Dhuvasukhaattavirahito, maggoiti suññatā tesu.

What  $\bar{A}$ nanda is empty of a self, or anything belonging to a self? Eye  $\bar{A}$ nanda, is empty of a self, or anything belonging to a self and eye-consciousness is empty of a self, or anything belonging to a self ...<sup>64</sup>" This is repeated with regard to ear, sounds, and ear-consciousness, and so on.

On another occasion the Buddha, teaching the practice that is helpful, or conducive to, nibbāna (*nibbānasappaya*) says, that one views eye, forms, eye-consciousness, and eye-contact as impermanent (*anicca*). Whatever is experienced, whether happiness, ill or neither happiness nor ill arises dependent on eye-contact, one views that too as impermanent (*anicca*). So also with regard to ear and sounds etc., nose and smells etc., tongue etc., all of them he views as impermanent (*anicca*).

In the next Sutta these same things are viewed as ill followed by the next Sutta in which these same things are viewed as not-self ( $anatt\bar{a}$ ).

Now, when viewing of things as not-self is helpful for, or conducive to, nibbāna, nibbāna itself cannot be not-self ( $anatt\bar{a}$ ).

While the Suttas cited above limit themselves to the consideration of the personality and therefore to the animate, this Sutta, since it considers the world (*loka*), surveys a wider field which includes the six sense-bases that embrace the inanimate as well. This is as far as it can go, and it is the whole range of the mundane. If the doctrine of not-self (*anattā*) were to penetrate further afield beyond the mundane into the unconditioned, then nibbāna, which to the earnest follower of the Dhamma is the thought of his day and the dream of his night, will cease to be the unconditioned any more. And the uttermost freedom from all fetters human and divine which is the cessation of ill, would be an impossibility. Here too, as before, the Sutta of the Four Great or Principal Authorities applies.

That nibbāna, the unconditioned, should not be considered as not-self (*anattā*) but as happiness (*sukha*), is stated in the following Sutta:

"Here, monks, a certain person dwells contemplating ill (dukkhanupassi) in all formations (sabbasaṅkharesu), not-self (anattā) in all things (sabbesu dhammesu); he dwells contemplating happiness in nibbāna (nibbane sukhanupassi), perceiving happiness therein (sui.hasanni), experiencing happiness (sukhapatisamvedi), continually, uninterruptedly, inclined towards it in mind, and penetrating it with wisdom. Having destroyed the cankers, he abides cankerless here and now, mind-freed and wisdom-freed. Monks, this is the first person who is worthy of offerings ... the world's peerless field of merit.<sup>65</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> S IV 54: Yasmā ca kho, ānanda, suññaṃ attena vā attaniyena vā tasmā suñño lokoti vuccati. Kiñca, ānanda, suññaṃ attena vā attaniyena vā. Rūpā suññā attena vā attaniyena vā, cakkhuviññāṇaṃ suññaṃ attena vā attaniyena vā, cakkhusamphasso suñño attena vā attaniyena vā...pe... yampidaṃ manosamphassapaccayā uppajjati vedayitaṃ sukhaṃ vā dukkhaṃ vā adukkhamasukhaṃ vā tampi suññaṃ attena vā attaniyena vā. Yasmā ca kho, ānanda, suññaṃ attena vā attaniyena vā, tasmā suñño lokoti vuccatī ti.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> S IV 133–35: Nibbānasappāyaṃ vo, bhikkhave, paṭipadaṃ desessāmi. Taṃ suṇātha...pe... katamā ca sā, bhikkhave, nibbānasappāyā paṭipadā? Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu cakkhuṃ aniccanti passati, rūpā aniccāti passati, cakkhuviññānam aniccanti passati, cakkhusamphasso aniccoti passati. Yampidam

When a person grows weary of all conditioned things, whether they are called formations or things, which are stamped with the three characteristics of impermanence, ill, and not-self, he loosens the fetters that bind him, and proceeds towards the freedom and happiness of nibbāna, says the Sutta.

The eye, monks, is impermanent (anicca); what is impermanent that is ill (dukkha); what is ill that is not-self (anattā); what is not-self is not mine, that am I not, that is not my self. Thus it should be seen with clear understanding as it truly is ... mind is impermanent. Thus seeing, the learned disciple of the noble is weary of eye ... weary of mind. Wearied, he is estranged; estranged, he is freed; in being freed he knows that he is free. Destroyed is birth, lived is the life of purity, done what had to be done, and after this present life there is no beyond. Thus seeing the instructed disciple of the noble one is disenchanted as regard eye is disenchanted as regards mind; being disenchanted he unstains and when he has unstained his mind is released; when it has been released he has the knowledge it, has been released and he understands, "Birth has been exhausted; the celibate life has been lived; what ought to be done has been done and there is nothing of this to be again" (Soma Thera's translation).

In another Sutta the Buddha teaches the perception of impermanence (*aniccasanna*), the perception of ill in impermanence (*anicce dukkhasanna*) and the perception of not-self in ill (*dukkhe anattāsanna*) which, when developed and cultivated are great in result, great in advantage plunging into the deathless, ending in the deathless.<sup>67</sup>

cakkhusamphassapaccayā uppajjati vedayitaṃ sukhaṃ vā dukkhaṃ vā adukkhamasukhaṃ vā tampi aniccanti passati...pe... jivhā aniccāti passati, rasā aniccāti passati, jivhāviñāṇaṃ aniccanti passati, jivhāsamphasso aniccoti passati, yampidaṃ jivhāsamphassapaccayā uppajjati vedayitaṃ sukhaṃ vā dukkhaṃ vā adukkhamasukhaṃ vā tampi aniccanti passati...pe... mano aniccoti passati, dhammā aniccāti passati, manoviññāṇaṃ aniccanti passati, manosamphasso aniccoti passati, yampidaṃ manosamphassapaccayā uppajjati vedayitaṃ sukhaṃ vā dukkhaṃ vā adukkhamasukhaṃ vā tampi aniccanti passati. Ayaṃ kho sā, bhikkhave, nibbānasappāyā paṭipadā''ti

Nibbānasappayant vo bhikkhave patioadam de.rissami tam sunatha ... pa ... katam6 ca sa bhikkhave nihba» wappdya paṭipadā.Mano aniccoti passati dhammn aniccati manoviññāṇam aniccanti passatI manosnmphasso aniccoti pas.ratI yam pidam martosamphassnpaccaya uppajjāti vedayitam ... adukkhamasukham va tam pi aniccanti passati. (Nibbāna-sappayan tI nibbānassa sappayam upakaraka-paṭipadām—S-a II, 402).

<sup>66</sup> A IV 14: Idha, bhikkhave, ekacco puggalo sabbasankhāresu aniccānupassī viharati, ... ... sabbasankhāresu dukkhānupassī viharati ... ... Nibbāne sukhānupassī viharati sukhasaññī sukhapaṭisaṃvedī satataṃ samitaṃ abbokiṇṇaṃ cetasā adhimuccamāno paññāya pariyogāhamāno. So āsavānaṃ khayā...pe... sacchikatvā upasampajja viharati. Ayaṃ bhikkhave, paṭhamo puggalo āhuneyyo... pe... puññakkhettaṃ lokassa.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> S IV I-2 Cakkhuṃ, bhikkhave, aniccaṃ. Yadaniccaṃ taṃ dukkhaṃ; yaṃ dukkhaṃ tadanattā. Yadanattā taṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā' ti evametaṃ yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya daṭṭhabbaṃ. Sotaṃ aniccaṃ. Yadaniccaṃ...pe... ghānaṃ aniccaṃ. Yadaniccaṃ...pe... jivhā aniccā. Yadaniccaṃ taṃ dukkhaṃ; yaṃ dukkhaṃ tadanattā. Yadanattā taṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā' ti evametaṃ yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya daṭṭhabbaṃ. Kāyo anicco. Yadaniccaṃ...pe... mano anicco. Yadaniccaṃ taṃ dukkhaṃ; yaṃ dukkhaṃ tadanattā. Yadanattā taṃ 'netaṃ mama, nesohamasmi, na meso attā' ti evametaṃ yathābhūtaṃ sammappaññāya daṭṭhabbaṃ. Evaṃ passaṃ, bhikkhave, sutavā ariyasāvako cakkhusmimpi nibbindati, sotasmimpi nibbindati, ghānasmimpi nibbindati, jivhāyapi nibbindati, kāyasmimpi nibbindati, manasmimpi nibbindati. Nibbindaṃ virajjati; virāgā vimuccati; vimuttasmiṃ vimuttamiti ñāṇaṃ hoti. 'Khīṇā jāti, vusitaṃ brahmacariyaṃ, kataṃ karaṇīyam, nāparaṃ itthattāyā' ti pajānātī'' ti

These Suttas show clearly that not-self (anattā) cannot be considered apart from impermanence (anicca) and ill (dukkha) since they are linked together. Not-self (anattā) does not stand by itself, for it proceeds from these two conditions, impermanence and ill. One condition flows into the other. Nibbāna is not ill (dukkha) but is happiness (sukha) and has to be regarded as such if one ever hopes to attain it. Thus it cannot be considered in the same way as everything else has to be considered. Even the happiness of nibbāna is different from every other kind of happiness. Nibbāna's happiness is the happiness of relief, while all the other kinds of happiness are bound up with feeling (vedanā). The happiness of nibbāna does not change, while every other kind of happiness changes. Therefore the Buddha says:

"Monks, should a monk regard nibbāna as ill, it is impossible for him to be endowed with adaptive patience; it is impossible for him to enter the right path; without entering the right path it is impossible for him to realise the fruit of Stream-Entrance ... and the consummate state.

"Monks, should a monk regard nibbāna as happiness it is then possible for him to be endowed with adaptive patience; being thus endowed it is possible for him to enter the right path; having entered the right path, it is possible for him to realise fruit of Stream-Entrance ... and the consummate state.<sup>68</sup>"

Because the conditioned is the sphere where not-self (anattā), which is inseparable from impermanence (anicca) and ill (dukkha), holds sway, the disciple of the noble is wearied of, and estranged, and therefore freed, from the conditioned; and he knows that he is freed. This is nibbāna. Now if nibbāna, too, is not-self (anattā), has not then one to be wearied of, estranged, and freed, from nibbāna as well? How then can one attain nibbāna? Is it possible for one to be wearied of, estranged, and freed, from a thing and at the same time attain it? When one says that nibbāna is not-self (anattā) one also says that nibbāna has to be given up. And if that happens one continues to remain securely bound to saṃsāra, and has not moved a step away from it. But the exhortation of the Buddha is to aspire to attain it:

Abandon everything that keeps thee bound;

*In thine own self, thy own protection find.* 

As one should act whose turban is ablaze,

A IV 46: Sattimā, bhikkhave, saññā bhāvitā bahulīkatā mahapphalā honti mahānisaṃsā amatogadhā amatapariyosānā. Katamā satta? Asubhasaññā, maraṇasaññā, āhāre paṭikūlasaññā, sabbaloke anabhiratasaññā, aniccasaññā, anicce dukkhasaññā, dukkhe anattasaññā.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> AIII 442–43: So vata, bhikkhave, bhikkhu nibbānaṃ dukkhato samanupassanto anulomikāya khantiyā samannāgato bhavissatī'ti netaṃ ṭhānaṃ vijjati. 'Anulomikāya khantiyā asamannāgato sammattaniyāmaṃ okkamissatī'ti netaṃ ṭhānaṃ vijjati. 'Sammattaniyāmaṃ anokkamamāno sotāpattiphalaṃ vā sakadāgāmiphalaṃ vā anāgāmiphalaṃ vā arahattaṃ vā sacchikarissatī'ti netaṃ ṭhānaṃ vijjati. So vata, bhikkhave, bhikkhu nibbānaṃ sukhato samanupassanto anulomikāya khantiyā samannāgato bhavissatī'ti ṭhānametaṃ vijjati. 'Anulomikāya khantiyā samannāgato sammattaniyāmaṃ okkamissatī'ti ṭhānametaṃ vijjati. 'Sammattaniyāmaṃ okkamamāno sotāpattiphalaṃ vā sakadāgāmiphalaṃ vā anāgāmiphalaṃ vā arahattam vā sacchikarissatī'ti thānametam vijjatī ti.

Act then aspiring for the deathless state. 69

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> S III 143: Jaheyya sabbasaṃyogaṃ, kareyya saraṇattano; Careyyādittasīsova, patthayaṃ accutaṃ padan–ti. Soma Thera's translation

# Some parallel Sutta-passages

- (1) Having cut off hair and beard, donning the orange robe, one goes from home to homelessness. Thus having gone forth, he puts away the five hindrances which weaken wisdom, is well established in the four foundations of mindfulness, and, having cultivated in their real essence the seven factors of wisdom, attains nibbāna which has nothing to do with either good or bad.<sup>70</sup>
- (2) Monks, should one call these five hindrances a heap of demerit, he would be saying so rightly. Monks, a whole heap of demerit are the five hindrances.

Monks, should one call the four foundations of mindfulness a heap of merit, he would be saying so rightly. Monks, a whole heap of merit are the four foundations of mindfulness.<sup>71</sup>

- (3) Monks, those monks who are novices recently gone forth, newly come to this doctrine and discipline—those monks should be roused to the practice of, and fixed and established in, the four foundations of mindfulness.<sup>72</sup>
- (4) (The Venerable Anuruddha Thera to the Venerable Sāriputta Thera:) Friend, one who has partially cultivated the four foundations of mindfulness is a learner (*sekha*) ...

Friend, one who has completely cultivated the four foundations of mindfulness is a learning-ender (*asekha*).<sup>73</sup>

(5) Here, monks, in a monk living diligent, ardent, resolute, there arises the controlling faculty of pain (*dukkha-indriya*). It is with attributes, cause, essential properties, and conditions. That the controlling faculty of pain should arise without attributes, cause, essential properties, and conditions, is certainly not possible. He knows well the controlling faculty of pain, he knows well its arising, and he knows well its cessation. And he also knows well where arising it ceases without remainder. How does the arisen controlling

A III 387: So kesamassum ohāretvā kāsāyāni vatthāni acchādetvā agārasmā anagāriyam pabbajati. So evam pabbajito samāno pañca nīvaraņe pahāya cetaso upakkilese paññāya dubbalīkaraņe, catúsu satipaṭṭhānesu suppatiṭṭhitacitto, satta bojjhaòge yathābhútam bhāvetvā akaṇham asukkam nibbānam abhijāyati. Evam kho, ānanda, sukkābhijātiyo samāno akaṇham asukkam nibbānam abhijāyati. Imā kho, ānanda, cha¿abhijātiyo.
<sup>71</sup> S V 146: Akusalarāsī ti, bhikkhave, vadamāno pañca nīvaraņe sammā vadamāno vadeyya. Kevalo hāyam, bhikkhave, akusalarāsi, yadidam pañca nīvaraṇā. Katame pañca? Kāmacchandanīvaraṇam, byāpādanīvaraṇam, thinamiddhanīvaraṇam, uddhaccakukkuccanīvaraṇam, vicikicchānīvaraṇam. ... Kusalarāsī ti, bhikkhave, vadamāno cattāro satipaṭṭhāne sammā vadamāno vadeyya. Kevalo hāyam, bhikkhave, kusalarāsi, yadidam — cattāro satipaṭṭhānā. Katame cattāro? Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu kāye kāyānupassī viharati ātāpī sampajāno satimā, vineyya loke abhijjhādomanassam; vedanāsu...pe... citte...pe... dhammesu dhammānupassī viharati ātāpī sampajāno satimā, vineyya loke abhijjhādomanassam.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> S V 145: Ye te, bhikkhave, bhikkhū navā acirapabbajitā adhunāgatā imam dhammavinayam, te vo, bhikkhave, bhikkhū catunnam satipaṭṭhānānam bhāvanāya samādapetabbā nivesetabbā patiṭṭhāpetabbā. Katamesam catunnam? Etha tumhe, āvuso, kāye kāyānupassino viharatha ātāpino sampajānā ekodibhūtā vippasannacittā samāhitā ekaggacittā, kāyassa yathābhūtam ñāṇāya; ... dhammānam yathābhūtam ñāṇāya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> S V 175: Kittāvatā nu kho, āvuso, sekho hotī ti? Catunnaṃ kho, āvuso, satipaṭṭhānānaṃ padesaṃ bhāvitattā sekho hoti. ... Kittāvatā nu kho, āvuso, asekho hotī ti? Catunnaṃ kho, āvuso, satipaṭṭhānānaṃ samattaṃ bhāvitattā asekho hoti.

faculty of pain cease without remainder? Here, monks, aloof from sense-desires, aloof from evil states of mind, a monk attains the first meditation ( $jh\bar{a}na$ ) which is with initial and sustained application of thought, joy and ease born of detachment. There the arisen controlling faculty of pain ceases without remainder. Monks, this is called a monk who knows the cessation of the controlling faculty of pain, who has concentrated his mind for the state of being so.

(The controlling faculty of grief ceases without remainder with the attainment of the second meditation, the controlling faculty of ease ceases without remainder with the attainment of the third meditation, the controlling faculty of pleasure ceases without remainder with the attainment of the fourth, and the controlling faculty of neither pleasure nor pain ceases without remainder with the attainment of the cessation of perception and feeling).<sup>74</sup>

- (6) What, monks, is the power of contemplation (*bhāvanā bala*)? Here, monks, a monk aloof from sense desires, aloof from evil states of mind, attains the first meditation which is with initial and sustained application of thought, joy and ease born of detachment ... attains the fourth and abides therein.<sup>75</sup>
- (7) Monks, there are these five controlling faculties, which five? The controlling faculties of faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration, and wisdom. Monks, these are the five controlling faculties. By the accomplishment and fulfilment of these controlling faculties one is a Consummate One: when they are weaker than that, one is a Non-Returner; when they are weaker than that, one is a Stream-Entrant; when they are weaker than that, one is dhamma-striver; and when they are weaker than that, one is a faith-striver.

Thus indeed, monks, there is a difference of controlling faculties, there is a difference of fruits, there is a difference of powers, and there is a difference of persons.<sup>76</sup>

(8) (The Venerable Lomāsavangisa Thera: ) Friend, Mahānama, those are learner-monks, who have not attained perfection, who aspiring to the peerless freedom from bondage, live having put away the five hindrances ...

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> S V 213: Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhuno appamattassa ātāpino pahitattassa viharato uppajjati dukkhindriyam. So evam pajānāti— 'uppannam kho me idam dukkhindriyam, tañca kho sanimittam sanidānam sasankhāram sappaccayam. Tañca animittam anidānam asankhāram appaccayam dukkhindriyam uppajjissatīti, netam thānam vijjati'. So dukkhindriyanca pajānāti, dukkhindriyasamudayanca pajānāti, dukkhindriyanirodhanca pajānāti, yattha cuppannam dukkhindriyam aparisesam nirujjhati tañca pajānāti. Kattha cuppannam dukkhindriyam aparisesam nirujjhati? Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu vivicceva kāmehi ... paṭhamam jhānam upasampajja viharati, ettha cuppannam dukkhindriyam aparisesam nirujjhati. ... tatiyam jhānam upasampajja viharati, ettha cuppannam somanassindriyam aparisesam nirujjhati. ... catuttham jhānam upasampajja viharati, ettha cuppannam somanassindriyam aparisesam nirujjhati. ... saññāvedayitanirodham upasampajja viharati, ettha cuppannam upekkhindriyam aparisesam nirujjhati.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> A I 53: Katamañca, bhikkhave, bhāvanābalam? Idha, bhikkhave, bhikkhu vivicceva kāmehi, ... paṭhamaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharati. ... catutthaṃ jhānaṃ upasampajja viharati.
<sup>76</sup> S V 200.

Friend, Mahānama, those monks who are Consummate Ones, who have destroyed the cankers, reached perfection, done what had to be done, laid down the burden, won to the goal, destroyed the fetters of the states of existence, and are freed by utmost knowledge —in them these five hindrances are abandoned, uprooted, pulled out of the ground like a palmyra palm, eradicated, and not liable to come into existence again.<sup>77</sup>

Again, monks, the monk who is a learner (*sekha*) knows well the five controlling faculties: Faith, energy, mindfulness, concentration, and wisdom. Yet he neither lives experiencing with the body, nor penetrates with wisdom, what they lead to, their excellence, their fruit, and their end. Monks, this is indeed the way according to which the learnermonk, standing in the plane of the learner, knows: "I am a learner"

What is the way according to which the learning-ender (*asekha*), standing in the plane of the learning-ender, knows: "I am a learning-ender?" Here a monk who is a learning-ender knows well the five controlling faculties: Faith and wisdom. He lives experiencing with the body, and penetrates with wisdom, what they lead to, their excellence, their fruit, and their end. This is indeed the way, monks, according to which the learning-ender, standing in the plane of the Learning-ender, knows: "I am a learning-ender"

Few are those beings who, passing away as humans, are reborn as humans; at the same time greater in number are those beings who, passing away as humans, are reborn in the animal world, the world of the manes, and in places of torment and torture. Few are those beings who, passing away as devas, are reborn as devas; at the same time greater in number are those who passing away as devas, are reborn in hell, in the animal world, and in the world of the manes.

Few are those beings who, passing away as devas, are reborn as humans; at the same time greater in number are those beings, who, passing away as devas, are reborn in hell in the animal world, and in the world of the manes.

What is the reason? Not seeing, monks, the Four Noble Truths: the Noble Truth of Ill, the Noble Truth of the Arising of Ill, the Noble Truth of the Cessation of Ill, and the Noble Truth of the path leading to the Cessation of Ill.<sup>78</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> S V 327: So eva nu kho, bhante, sekho vihāro so tathāgatavihāro, udāhu aññova sekho vihāro añño tathāgatavihāro ti? Na kho, āvuso mahānāma, sveva sekho vihāro, so tathāgatavihāro. Añño kho, āvuso mahānāma, sekho vihāro, añño tathāgatavihāro. Ye te, āvuso mahānāma, bhikkhū sekhā appattamānasā anuttaram yogakkhemam patthayamānā viharanti, te pañca nīvarane pahāya viharanti. ... Yepi te, āvuso mahānāma, bhikkhū sekhā appattamānasā anuttaram yogakkhemam patthayamānā viharanti, te ime pañca nīvarane pahāya viharanti. Ye ca kho te, āvuso mahānāma, bhikkhū arahanto khīnāsavā vusitavanto katakaranīyā ohitabhārā anuppattasadatthā parikkhīṇabhavasaṃyojanā sammadaññā vimuttā, tesaṃ pañca nīvaraṇā pahīnā ucchinnamūlā tālāvatthukatā anabhāvaṃkatā āyatiṃ anuppādadhammā.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> S V 474–77: Evameva kho, bhikkhave, appamattakā te sattā ye manussesu paccājāyanti; atha kho eteva bahutarā sattā ye aññatra manussehi paccājāyanti. Taṃ kissa hetu? Adiṭṭhattā, bhikkhave, catunnaṃ ariyasaccānaṃ. Katamesaṃ catunnaṃ? Dukkhassa ariyasaccassa...pe... dukkhanirodhagāminiyā paṭipadāya ariyasaccassa....

Evameva kho, bhikkhave, appakā te sattā ye manussā cutā manussesu paccājāyanti; atha kho eteva bahutarā sattā ye manussā cutā niraye paccājāyanti...

Monks, should anyone say: "Without understanding the Noble Truth of Ill in its real essence ... and the Noble Truth of the Path leading to the Cessation of Ill, I will thoroughly make an end of Ill"—for him no such possibility exists.

Monks, it is as if someone should say: "Without erecting the lower part of a house I will erect its peaked roof." Just so, monks, is he who says: "Without understanding the Noble Truth of Ill ..." for him no such possibility exists<sup>79</sup>.

Thus, indeed, monks, the completion of association with the unworthy completes the hearing of the not-good dhamma; the completion of the hearing of the not-good dhamma completes disbelief; the completion of disbelief completes unwise attention; the completion of unwise attention completes lack of mindfulness and clear comprehension; lack of mindfulness and clear comprehension completes non-restraint of the senses; the completion of non-restraint of the senses completes the three evil ways of conduct; the completion of the three evil ways of conduct completes the five hindrances; the completion of the five hindrances completes Ignorance.<sup>80</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> S V 452: Yo hi, bhikkhave, evaṃ vadeyya — ahaṃ dukkhaṃ ariyasaccaṃ yathābhūtaṃ anabhisamecca ... dukkhanirodhagāminiṃ paṭipadaṃ ariyasaccaṃ yathābhūtaṃ anabhisamecca sammā dukkhassantaṃ karissāmī'ti — netaṃ ṭhānaṃ vijjati. Seyyathāpi, bhikkhave, yo evaṃ vadeyya — ahaṃ kūṭāgārassa heṭṭhimaṃ gharaṃ akaritvā uparimaṃ gharaṃ āropessāmī ti — netaṃ ṭhānaṃ vijjati; evameva kho, bhikkhave, yo evaṃ vadeyya — 'ahaṃ dukkhaṃ ariyasaccaṃ yathābhūtaṃ anabhisamecca...pe... dukkhanirodhagāminiṃ paṭipadaṃ ariyasaccaṃ yathābhūtaṃ anabhisamecca sammā dukkhassantaṃ karissāmī'ti — netaṃ ṭhānaṃ vijjati.

<sup>80 12.</sup> A V 113–14: Iti kho, bhikkhave, asappurisasaṃsevo paripūro asaddhammassavanaṃ paripūreti, asaddhammassavanaṃ paripūraṭi, assaddhiyaṃ paripūraṭi, assaddhiyaṃ paripūraṭi, ayonisomanasikāraṃ paripūreti, ayonisomanasikāro paripūro asatāsampajaññaṃ paripūreti, asatāsampajaññaṃ paripūraṃ indriyaasaṃvaraṃ paripūreti, indriyaasaṃvaro paripūro tīṇi duccaritāni paripūreti, tīṇi duccaritāni paripūrāni pañca nīvaraṇe paripūrenti, pañca nīvaraṇā paripūrā avijjaṃ paripūrenti. Evametissā avijjāya āhāro hoti, evañca pāripūri.